



# City of Niagara Falls, New York

P.O. Box 69, Niagara Falls, NY 14302-0069

## NIAGARA FALLS HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION Tyler Scriven, Chairperson

**MEETING MINUTES**  
**Thursday, November 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2022,**  
**6:00 PM**  
**Committee of the Whole Room**  
**745 Main Street, Room 117**

### CALL TO ORDER

Meeting called to order at 6:05 PM.

**BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Tyler Scriven, Chairperson  
Brett Doster, Vice Chairperson  
Georgia Robinson-Bradberry  
Evan Wright  
Andrea Fortin Nossavage

**BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Kristina Zell

**ATTENDEES:**

Bryce Boggs  
Richard Zucco  
Lori Caso  
Francesca Dormborya  
Wendy Bodnoff  
Rabia Ellahi

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Kevin Forma, Director of Planning

### APPROVAL OF AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING

MR. DOSTER noted that the scheduled speaker would not be able to attend as planned due to a scheduling conflict and the agenda should be amended to reflect this change.

*MR. DOSTER made a motion to approve the amended agenda. MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE seconded the motion. APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.*

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

*A motion to approve the minutes from the August 8, 2022 meeting was made by MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE and seconded by MS. ROBINSON-BRADBERRY*

## PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

There was no public participation.

## ACTION ITEMS

### 1. Certificate of Appropriateness: 320 Cedar Avenue

Power City Landmark QOBZ LLC, applicant, for owner of property at 320 Cedar Avenue (SBL: 144.77-1-52) is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate, repair exterior components. Demolish existing detached garage and installation of electric vehicular chargers.

ROD DAVIS, representative of Power City Landmark spoke and stated that they would like to renovate and repair exterior components, including windows as well as demolish existing detached garage for the purpose of installing electric vehicle chargers.

MR. DOSTER requested additional photos showing other elevations of the existing building and the garages. MR. DOSTER advised that the applicant would need to apply for economic hardship in order for the garage to be demolished since per the Historic Preservation Law the only method allowed for demolition is via economic hardship. MR DOSTER then inquired if chargers could be put into the existing garage as an alternative to demolition.

*Motion to **table** the application of Power City Landmark QOBZ LLC Certificate of Appropriateness was made by MR. DOSTER and seconded by MS. ROBINSON-BRADBERRY.*

MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE	YES
MR. DOSTER	YES
MR. SCRIVEN	YES
MR. WRIGHT	YES
MS. ROBINSON-BRADBERRY	YES

### **MOTION: APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY**

### 2. Certificate of Appropriateness: 627 4<sup>th</sup> Street

Rabia Ellahi, applicant, for property at 627 4<sup>th</sup> Street (SBL: 59.21-1-18) is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new front porch.

DR. MAHMOOD spoke on behalf of the applicant about issues with his neighbors and the construction of the front porch, which had been partially completed before coming to the Commission.

MR. SCRIVEN expressed sympathy for the applicant's issues with their neighbors for the commission as well and inquired if the applicant received a permit for the construction of the porch.

DR. MAHMOOD stated that they did not apply for or receive a permit for the construction of the porch. However other homes within the neighborhood built similar porches without permits. MR. DOSTER stated he performed a tour of the neighborhood prior to the meeting and did not see porches similar to the partially completed porch at this location. MR. DOSTER advised that if the applicant is aware of any construction going on in the neighborhood without a permit that the applicant should inform the City.

Several commissioners then openly discussed if the porch is appropriate while reviewing historic photos of the property.

Upon completion of the discussion the Commission concluded that the partially installed construction did not fit in with historic character of the house or the neighborhood. The Commission recommended the applicant should reinstall concrete steps and metal rail similar the one that was removed prior to the construction of the partially completed deck.

The applicant was advised to resubmit application along with the required drawings, showing the recommended course of action.

*A motion to **deny** Certificate of Appropriateness was made by MR DOSTER and seconded by MR. SCRIVEN*

MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE	YES
MR. DOSTER	YES
MR. SCRIVEN	YES
MR. WRIGHT	YES
MS. ROBINSON-BRADBURY	YES

**MOTION: APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY**

### 3. Certificate of Appropriateness: 6 4th Street

Bryce Boggs, applicant, for property at 6th 4th Street (SBL: 159.13-2-28) is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate and the existing porch structure and associated structural components.

BRYCE BOGGS of Precision Contracting Solutions spoke on behalf of the owner about the proposed renovation to the existing porch structure and associated structural components. MR. BOGGS explained that a decision was made to move forward with the renovation of the porch and return later with additional renovations when the project team was prepared to bring the additional renovations before the Commission. MR. BOGGS explained that the team has had difficulty obtaining historic photos of the property, but the current design of the porch was based off of the singular photo they were able to find which was included with the application package. MR. BOGGS went on to explain that they were using modern materials to construct the structural components. These structural components would remain largely hidden by the other deck components and in the areas they were in public view they would be clad in brick of a similar nature to the brick of the existing structure. MR. BOGGS went on to discuss how upon investigation of the porch they found the original wood decking and the project team is proposing to reconstruct the deck using material of the same nature as the original deck. Material samples of the brick and original deck were passed around to the Commission members.

MR. DOSTER inquired about the other structural components of the deck and commended the applicant on their approach.

MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE also commended the applicant on their approach and concurred with MR. DOSTER that the approach was appropriate.

*A motion to approve the application for the Certificate of Appropriateness was made by MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE and seconded by MR. DOSTER*

MS. FORTIN-NOSSAVAGE	YES
MR. DOSTER	YES
MR. SCRIVEN	YES
MR. WRIGHT	YES
MS. ROBINSON-BRADBURY	YES

**MOTION: APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY**

## **OLD BUSINESS**

MR. FORMA directed the commission to the letter from the acting Director of Community Development appointing him to the position of Secretary for the Commission. MR. FORMA reported to the members that as a follow up to their executive session on October 10, 2022, he had spoken with the New York State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) regarding the City's CLG status and would be providing additional information to the Commissioners on reestablishing the City's CLG status once he receives it from

## **NEW BUSINESS**

1. MR. DOSTER inquired about future plans for the Old Department of Community Development Building (Carnegie Library) which is a local landmark. The Department of Community Development did move back into City Hall and MR DOSTER expressed concern about the building being empty.
2. MR. DOSTER noted that it was reported by the news that the Earl Brydges Library is to receive \$5 million in upgrades and repair the roof. MR DOSTER also noted that while this building is part of the Main Street National Historic Landmark District it is not a local landmark. A letter should be sent requesting that we would be a commenting party on the section 106 review.

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

No communications

## **HISTORIAN'S REPORT**

No Historians Report

## **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

MR. DOSTER inquired if the two remaining audience members had anything to add after the last applicant. They stated they were there for the speaker. MR. DOSTER explained that an announcement was made at the start of meeting. The audience members then inquired about assistance to help their neighbor with his housing issues. MR. FORMA instructed the audience members to contact the City's Community Development office.

## **ADJOURN**

*A motion to **adjourn** was made at 7:35 p.m. by CHAIRPERSON SCRIVEN and seconded by MR. WRIGHT. The motion was unanimously approved.*