



Fifth Program Year CAPER

Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report includes Narrative Responses to CAPER questions that CDBG, HOME, HOPWA, and ESG grantees must respond to each year in order to be compliant with the Consolidated Planning Regulations. The Executive Summary narratives are optional.

The grantee must submit an updated Financial Summary Report (PR26).

GENERAL

Executive Summary

This module is optional but encouraged. Provide a brief overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the first year.

Program Year 5 CAPER Executive Summary response:

The City of Niagara Falls prepares a Consolidated Plan and Strategy to fulfill the requirements embodied in the Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy (CHAS) and requirements in the National Affordable Housing Act (NAHA). The intent of the Consolidated Plan is to:

- promote citizen participation and the development of local priority needs and objectives by providing comprehensive information that is easy to understand;
- coordinate the requirements in such a manner as to achieve the purposes of the Acts and to simplify the process of requesting and obtaining federal funds;
- promote the development of an action plan that provides the basis for assessing performance; and
- encourage consultation with public/private agencies to identify shared needs

The Act requires that in order to obtain Federal Housing and Urban Development (HUD) funds, local governments must have an approved Consolidated Plan and Strategy. The City of Niagara Falls must describe its housing needs and market conditions and set out a 5-year strategy that establishes priorities for addressing those needs, identify anticipated resources to be available, and to establish a one-year investment plan. The Consolidated Plan is a consolidated process for three entitlement formula grant programs: Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), HOME Investment Partnership Program (HOME) and Emergency Shelter Grant (ESG).

The Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report (CAPER) describes the City's progress in carrying out the annual Consolidated Plan and provides the City with an opportunity to assess its annual performance in relationship to its overall five-year Consolidated Plan priorities.

Covered Period of Performance:

The City of Niagara Falls' Consolidated Annual Plan Performance and Evaluation Report includes activities for the 2009 Fiscal Year – January 1, 2009 through December 31, 2009. It must be received by the U.S. Department of HUD no later than March 31, 2010.

Citizen Participation:

The CAPERS Report was made available for public comment on March 15, 2009 at a public hearing at 6:00 P.M. at the Carnegie Building, 1022 Main Street, Niagara Falls, NY. Advertisements notifying the public of the hearing and of the availability of the report appeared in the Niagara Gazette on February 26, 2010. Public comments received will be incorporated into the CAPER submitted to HUD.

CITIZENS SUMMARY REPORT
FY' 2009 RESOURCES AND PROGRAM ACCOMPLISHMENTS
 (This list is a summary of major activities and is not all inclusive of 2009 expenditures)

CPS PRIORITY NEED	AGENCY	BUDGET	SOURCE	FEDERAL FUNDS		PROJECTED		ACCOMP.	
				OBLIG.	EXPEND.	GOALS	IDIS Completions		
Homeownership									
closing cost/down payment	CITY	76,106	CDBG	27,651	27,651	8	households	12	households
closing cost/down-payment	NHS	12,434	CDBG	4,113	4,113	8	households	2	households
closing cost/down-payment	CCNDC	10,400	CDBG	10,000	10,000	8	households	4	households
Rental & Multi-Family Rehabilitations									
	CITY	117,985	CDBG	61,138	61,138	3	units	2	units
	NHS	130,546	CDBG	80,334	80,334	3	units	4	units
		206,546	HOME/CHDO	132,955	132,955	3	units	0	units
		0	RLF	0	0	3	units	2	units
	CCNDC	4,959	CDBG	3,947	3,947	0	units	0	units
		266,000	RLF	154,449	154,449	8	units	11	units
		148,636	HOME/CHDO	135,886	135,886	3	units	4	units
Single Family Rehab 0-80% of median income owner occupied	CITY-sf	540,653	CDBG	254,445	254,445	17	units	12	units
	CITY-sf	338,007	HOME	162,172	162,172	8	units	0	units
	CITY -sf	200,000	RLF*	163,525	163,525	2	units	2	units
"	CCNDC-sf	44,604	CDBG	4,881	4,881	0	units	0	units
		350,323	HOME	101,480	101,480	10	units	4	units
		0	RLF*	0	0	10	units	11	units
"	NHS-sf	168,495	CDBG	51,207	51,207	6	units	3	units
		464,395	HOME	184,103	184,103	10	units	13	units
		58,841	RLF*	6,169	220,928	4	units	0	units
"	HCRC-sf	147,683	CDBG	52,165	52,165	5	units	3	units
	HCRC - sf	117,915	RLF*	0	0	5	units	3	units
Rehab Prog Delivery	CITY	260,033	CDBG	260,033	260,033	n/a		n/a	
		58,875	HOME	51,580	51,580	n/a		n/a	
	NHS	15,000	HOME	12,225	12,225	n/a		n/a	
		100,000	CDBG	61,992	61,992	n/a		n/a	
	CCNDC	15,000	HOME	15,000	15,000	n/a		n/a	
		100,000	CDBG	100,000	100,000	n/a		n/a	
	HCRC	57,000	CDBG	28,500	28,500	n/a		n/a	
Commercial Facades	CITY	172,634	CDBG	22,895	22,895	5	facades	2	facades
Rental Assistance	SECTION 8	4,065,001	SEC 8	3,933,956	3,933,956	1,100	tenants	1,090	tenants
Public Improvements	CITY	272,019	CDBG	177,837	178,843	10,000	Persons	10,000	persons
Public Service Needs	CITY	603,979	CDBG	214,494	214,494	5,000	persons	6,000	persons
Homeless Needs	CITY	155,343	ESG	94,552	94,552	1,000	persons	1,041	persons
Clearance	CITY	851,698	CDBG	53,808	53,808	26	structures	23	structures
Administration	CITY	533,721	CDBG	533,721	533,721	n/a		n/a	

General Questions

1. Assessment of the one-year goals and objectives:
 - a. Describe the accomplishments in attaining the goals and objectives for the reporting period.
 - b. Provide a breakdown of the CPD formula grant funds spent on grant activities for each goal and objective.
 - c. If applicable, explain why progress was not made towards meeting the goals and objectives.
2. Describe the manner in which the recipient would change its program as a result of its experiences.

Assessment of One Year Goals and Objectives

The City of Niagara Falls implemented programs in FY' 09 that were consistent with the goals and objectives outlined in the 2009 Consolidated Plan and with the 5-Year strategy developed in 2005. This section will describe the accomplishments in attaining the goals and objectives for the reporting period in relationship to the priorities outlined in the City's 2009 Action Plan. The City addressed the high priorities listed below that were identified in the Consolidated Plan. Housing statistics are compiled based on the number of units completed in IDIS regardless of the funding year.

Priority #1 - Low Income Renters 0-30% MFI & 31-50% MFI

The City's Section 8 – Leased Housing Program provided rental assistance to approximately 1,100 low income renters in 2009. The City administered the Section 8 voucher program and also served as the County administrator. The 2009 Annual Plan projected a total lease-up of 725 City voucher holders and 360 County voucher holders. The actual year-end averages were 720 City vouchers and 365 County vouchers. The City's Family Self-Sufficiency Program (FSS) sets participant goals and accomplishment levels that help families seek and maintain suitable employment to sufficiency. Escrow accounts are established with increases in income from employment that can be used upon graduation from the program. In 2007 the City projected they would serve 10 City FSS participants and 5 County FSS participants. Actual assistance was provided to 5 households and 2 households respectively. The Section Welfare to Work program is now absorbed into the Section 8 Voucher program.

Priority #2 - Housing Rehabilitation -Other Low Income Renters 51-80% MFI

Other low income renters were assisted through multi-family housing rehabilitation and rental rehabilitation programs administered by the City's CD Department, Neighborhood Housing Services and Center City Development Corporation... The City projected a goal of 9 rental housing unit completions in 2009, from all funding sources, in compliance with CDBG and HOME income qualifications and regulatory criteria. A total of 23 units were actually completed in IDIS in 2009. Of the 23 units completed, 43% of the units were occupied by low income tenants and 57% by low/mod income tenants. The racial /ethnic distribution of the households is as follows: 65% White, 35% Black/African American. . A total of 20 new rental units were contractually obligated in 2009

Priority #3 - Housing Rehabilitation -Existing Owners 0-50% MFI and 51-80% MFI

Rehabilitation of existing owner units has been conducted by the City, Niagara Falls Neighborhood Housing Services, Center City NDC and Highland Community Revitalization Committee since the inception of the CDBG program. The programs differ slightly in nature and scope, however, the intent is to correct housing code violations and provide a safe and decent housing unit for low and moderate income households. The City projected a goal of 77 completed units in 2009. A total of 51 units were completed in IDIS in 2009. 14 housing units were brought into compliance with NYS Building Code units by the City, 15 by Center City 16 by Neighborhood Housing Services and 6 by HCRC. Of the 51 units completed, 33% were occupied by low income owners, and 67% by low/mod income owners. The racial/ethnic distribution of the households is as follows: 76% White, 24% Black/African American. The units are located in targeted geographical areas of the City consistent with the areas identified in the annual plan and in accordance with the housing strategy outlined in the 5-year plan. 50 new single family owner occupied housing units were contractually obligated in 2009.

Priority #4 - Homeownership Assistance <80% MFI

Homeownership assistance was provided to moderate income households by the City and its sub-recipients. Assistance was provided in the form of \$2,500 (maximum) CDBG funded closing cost grants administered by the City, Center City and NHS. Assistance is provided only to qualified candidates that successfully complete a pre-purchase a homebuyer education and/or credit counseling session. 1st time homebuyers select a home of their choice, pre-qualify for a private mortgage and receive the closing cost grant based on the amount necessary as derived from the HUD-1 form. In certain instances, when required, rehabilitation is combined with the homeownership assistance. The City projected a goal of 24 closing cost grants in 2009. A total of 18 households were actually funded for closing costs grants in 2009. 18 clients were assisted with CDBG funding: 39% were low income homebuyers and 61% were low/mod income. The racial/ethnic distribution of the households is as follows: 89% White, 11% Black/African American.

Priority #5 - Homeless Persons Individuals and Families Combined

Homeless assistance was given in the form of essential services provided to seven (7) non-profit homeless service providers. Community Missions Inc., Fellowship House, Family & Children's Service, YMCA, God's Woman – House of Hosea and Odallam Inc each received approximately \$13,750 for essential services and/or operating expenses in 2009. The estimated number of homeless persons assisted in 2009 as a result of these projects is as follows:

Community Missions	535	YMCA	308
Fellowship House	24	God's Woman	15
Family & Children's Service	83	Carolyn's House	74
Odallam Inc	2		

Priority #6 - Public Service Needs

CDBG funded public service grants were provided for the following activities in 2009.

Neighborhood Police Substations/Substation Officers - The Niagara Falls Police Department assigned two police officers to be stationed at three police substations in the City. The three substations are located at 2815 Highland Avenue, 1677 Linwood Avenue and 496 19th Street. Community Development funds were used to pay rent and utilities at the substation locations and to pay the salaries of the substation officers. The three substations are located in high crime areas of the City as designated by the Niagara Falls Police Department. The Niagara Falls Block Clubs and area business associations were actively involved in site selections and advocated strongly for the police presence in the selected neighborhoods. Community reaction has been generally positive; the 18th Street location is also used as a community resource center. The mission of the center is to provide education, resources and general neighborhood support through the establishment of collaborative partnerships whose objectives are to improve the community by empowering residents to improve and enhance their quality of life. The partners in this endeavor are the NF Police Department, the NF Fire Department, the NF Department of Community Development, the NF Dept. of Inspections, the Recreation Department, Niagara Falls Block Club Council, Niagara Falls School District, Niagara Falls Weed & Seed, NF Memorial Hospital Community Health Worker Program, ReNU Niagara, COPC, and various faith based organizations. CDBG funds were used to pay rent at the facility. \$120,000 was budgeted for the salaries of two officers and \$30,000 for rental fees and utility costs.

Statistics provided by the NF police Department – Youth Aid Division indicate that there was a 19% drop in youth contacts in 2009, compared to 2008

Weed & Seed Youth Mentoring - \$30,000 in CDBG funds were also used to fund the Weed & Seed Youth Mentoring Coordinator. The Youth Mentoring program is designed to match 15 at risk middle school youth ages 14-19 with 15 local businesses professionals as well as Niagara University's "Learn & Serve" students who will act as mentors. The participants will be involved in a variety of structured enrichment opportunities consisting of educational, cultural and recreational experiences. 18 students participated in the program in 2009. Services provided include the following:

- College preparatory workshops
- Leadership development program
- Educational enrichment
- Internship opportunities
- Speaker's forum
- Cultural & recreational activities

Fire Safety Education Coordinator - this Niagara Falls Fire Department position provided educational and guidance in fire safety measures to school children, community groups, block club associations and other interested parties predominantly in low/mod income areas of the City. \$50,000 in CDBG funds were allocated for this position. Approximately 5,526 individuals were provided services through this program in 2009. Services provided include the following:

- Partnered with NF Police Dept in Safe Shopping Days/Blood pressure screenings
- Juvenile firefighters intervention (JFire)
- Youth Fire Academy in conjunction with Weed & Seed
- Partnered with Niagara County on Smoke Alarm in Every Home Initiative
- Outreach Programs dealing with Accidental Fire Prevention

New Jerusalem Boy's Reporting Center - \$100,000 in CDBG funds were allocated to the Center to provide counseling to young men referred by the Probation Dept and Court System. The

goal of this program is to provide a positive male role model, reduce teen pregnancies, and to reduce the recidivism rate among youthful offenders in Family Court. Services were provided to 31 young men in 2009 including the following:

- Providing a strong male role model
- Reduction in teen pregnancies
- Reduce recidivism among diligent offenders
- Reduce crime and negative police contact

Niagara Falls Housing Authority – Summer Enrichment Program - \$15,000 was allocated to provide a comprehensive program during the summer months that included etiquette classes, literacy programs, computer training, music arts and crafts. A total of 166 young persons participated in the various Summer Enrichment activities Other services included:

- Partnering with Planned Parenthood & Family & Children’s Service to provide a series of specialized self-esteem and character building workshops
- Safe haven for children during the summer months.

Youth Motivation Movement - \$15,000 was allocated to the Youth Motivation Movement with the stated goals of increasing school academic achievement, reducing out of school suspension and decreasing the incidence of youth crimes. 60 young persons participated in the program in 2009.

Niagara Arts & Cultural Center – After School Program - \$12,500 in CDBG funds were allocated to the NACC to provide tuition free academic, youth development and cultural activities for registered students ages 7-18. Sessions were held in four seasonal blocks providing a safe environment for the participants to increase academic achievement and reduce stress on working families. In 2009, 199 young persons participated in the various programs offered by the NACC

Priority#7 – Interim Assistance

\$15,824 of CDBG funds were used to pay the salaries of the Clean Neighborhood Enforcement Team, providing interim assistance in low/mod targeted areas of the city. The “team” consisted of approximately 10 seasonal workers that provide grass cutting, removal of bulk debris and brush, tree trimming, and cleaning of vacant lots in targeted low/mod income areas of the City. The program’s intent is to reinforce ongoing housing and commercial projects with this public service program, providing another resource for neighborhood revitalization. Various locations were targeted each week over a 10 week period affecting an estimated 2,000 residents. The following are the locations where services were provided:

- Michigan Avenue to Lockport Street from 11th Street to 13th Street
- North Avenue from 13th Street to 15th Street

Priority #8 - Clearance/Demolition of Blighted Structures

The City estimated that 26 blighted structures would be demolished in 2009. A total of 36 structures were included in two contracts that were awarded by City Council utilizing CDBG funding in the amount of 458,100. At the end of the reporting period 26 of the 36 had been demolished in targeted, low/mod areas of the City. The remaining properties are being abated of asbestos and will be demolished immediately thereafter. The City (CD) secured a \$200,00 grant award from the NYS Housing Finance Agency allowing us to use Neighborhood Stabilization Funds in conjunction with the CDBG funding allocated for clearance

Priority #9 - Code Enforcement

Code enforcement activities were accomplished to compliment ongoing CDBG & HOME funded housing rehabilitation projects. A City building inspectors stationed in the Community Development Administrative Office was assigned the responsibility of conducting code enforcement inspections for housing and commercial buildings in targeted areas of the City.

Priority #10 - Economic Development Needs

No new activity was conducted with CDBG funding in 2009. The major source of funding for economic development activities now resides with the use of 99-H Tribal Revenue funds. The remaining compliance reports for CDBG funded economic development will be completed by the CD office. In 2009 the following job creation activities took place:

The City projected that 5 new jobs would be created in 2009 from the MBE/WBE Loans and the Revolving Loan Fund. A total of 6.5 full time jobs were created of which all but one were provided to I/m persons. (See attached job creation reports)

Priority #11 - Public Facilities & Infrastructure Improvements

South Junior Park - In 2009 the City allocated \$115,000 and expended \$46,855 for the creation of a children's playground at the corner of Ferry Avenue and Portage Road. This park replaces the two parks that were shuttered at 9th Street and 13th Street. Improvements include a playground play structure, new fencing, landscaping, benches etc. This park was advocated for by concerned residents, parents and block clubs in the South End area of the City. The park is nearing completion, and will be opened in Spring 2010.

Milling and Resurfacing of Residential Streets - \$150,000 in CDBG funds were utilized to mill and resurface residential streets in low and moderate income areas of the City at the following locations

- 21st Street from Ferry Avenue to Niagara Street
- 26th Street from Ferry Avenue to Niagara Street
- Welch Avenue from 24th Street to 27th

Performance Measurements:

2009 Summary of Specific Housing/Community Development Objectives

Objective: Decent Housing

Outcome: Affordability

Needs to be Addressed	Goals to Address High Priority Needs	Activity	Performance Measure	5-yr goal 2005-2009	1-yr goal 2009	2009 Accomplishments.
Rental Housing rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> develop code compliant rental units for very low and low income persons, particularly large related and small related households increase supply of affordable rental units for low/mod households 	rehab assistance to low and moderate income households residing in rental housing	# rental units rehabilitated	125	9	23
Homebuyer Assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> promote sustained and increased homeownership opportunities and assist low/mod income renters make the transition to homeownership with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> home purchase incentives new construction homebuyer education housing counseling closing cost assistance 	closing cost and down payment assistance to l/m first-time homebuyers	# clients w/ pre-counseling # of clients that became owners # clients w/ other-counseling # clients w/CD closing cost grants	500 200 200 150	100 30 50 24	149 49 123 18
Single-family housing rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> promote code compliant housing units for owner occupied housing & lead hazard controls for/m households promote fair housing decreased incidence of fair housing complaints increase quality and habitability of owner-occupied housing 	rehab assistance to low and moderate income owners of single-family housing	# units brought into compliance # of seminars/level of participation	300 3	80 3	51 2
Construction of new housing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> increase supply of affordable housing units 	HOME funded construction subsidy to developers of housing for very-low income households	# of new units	50	2	0
tenant based rental assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> maintain & sustain housing choice vouchers 	administration of housing choice voucher program for very-low & l/m households	# of units leased	5,000	1,000	1,085

2009 Summary of Specific Non-Housing/Community Development Objectives

Objective: Creating Suitable Living Environments

Outcome: Sustainability

Needs to be Addressed	Goals to Address High Priority Needs	Activity	Performance Measure	5-yr goal 2005-2009	1-yr goal 2009.	2009 Accomplishments
Commercial Façade Improvements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> eliminate slums and blight in commercial districts 	commercial façade grants in designated slums/blight areas	# of businesses assisted	50	5	2
Pubic Facilities Infrastructure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> provide new or improved access support the renovation and improvement of public facilities aggressively serving predominantly low/mod income neighborhoods support public infrastructure improvements such as sidewalks, street, and parks in l/m areas 	public facility renovation and infrastructure improvements Pine & Main benches & Gill Creek walks	# of persons assisted # new projects	50,000 20	10,000 3	10,000 2
Public Services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> provide assistance to neighborhoods & community groups to aggressively improve public safety/perception of area promote youth services by supporting organizations that provide counseling, education & recreational opportunities 	Boy's Reporting Ctr. Weed & Seed NFHA	# of persons receiving new or increased assistance Decrease in crime rates	20,000	5,000	5,740 19% decrease in youth contacts
Clearance of blighted structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> demolish blighted structures in targeted slums/blight designated areas 	Demolition of blighted structures	# of structures demolished	125	26	23

Objective: Creating Economic Opportunities

Outcome: Affordability

Needs to be Addressed	Goals to Address High Priority Needs	Activity	Performance Measure	5-yr goal 2005-2009	1-yr goal 2009.	2009 Accomplishments
Jobs	opportunities with funding assistance	MBE/WBE grants	# full time jobs	250	5	6.5
	●support MBE/WBE businesses with funding assistance	micro-enterprise grants	# of low/mod jobs	127	3	5
	●support Micro-Enterprise with funding assistance		# MBE/WBE loans	25	0	0
	●provide support for job training and other employment opportunities for adults and adolescents		# Micro Enterprise loans	15	0	0
			# revolving loans	10	0	2

Summary of Specific Homeless/Special Needs Objectives

Objective: Suitable Living Environment

Outcome: Availability

Needs to be Addressed	Goals to Address High Priority Needs	Activity	Performance Measure	5-yr goal 2005-2009	1-yr goal 2009.	2009 Accomplishments
Homeless Assistance	costs for homeless shelter providers	ESG essential services and operating costs	# of persons assisted	5,000	1,000	1,041
	●establish a baseline to measure changes in the # of chronically homeless persons					
	●ensure a sufficient quantity of suitable housing exists to meet the needs of the homeless population					
	●provide support to organizations serving the homeless in order to help defray the cost burden of operating shelters for the homeless - essential services					
	●provide funding assistance to support and continue the Continuum of Care process					

3. Affirmatively Furthering Fair Housing:
 - a. Provide a summary of impediments to fair housing choice.
 - b. Identify actions taken to overcome effects of impediments identified.

Actions Taken To Affirmatively Further Fair Housing:

Impediments Identified in the Fair Housing Analysis

In May 2005 the City of Niagara Falls received the final copy of the 2005 Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing from its consultant, HOME (Housing Opportunities Made Equal). This firm was retained in 2004 to complete the analysis and to update the previous study from 1996 in compliance with the requirements of 24 CFR 570.904(c) (1) of the Community Development regulations. The 2005 study included a comparative analysis of public and private impediments to local fair housing choice. *Fair housing, as defined by HUD, is the ability of persons of similar income levels to have the same housing choices regardless of race, color, religion, handicap, financial status, or natural origin.*

The identification of fair housing concerns and problems in Niagara Falls involved the collection of information from both public and private sectors and covered fair housing complaints, violations or lawsuits; relevant public policies; review of the City's fair housing and CDBG activities; the degree of low income minority concentration in the City; and institutional practices within banking and real estate industries.

Based on the analysis performed, the following have been identified as impediments to fair housing choice in the City of Niagara Falls:

- a. Zoning
 - no impediments identified
- b. Code Enforcement
 - *Impediment:* large number of homes in disrepair, in low income minority areas
 - *Impediment* – limited funding for clearance of blighted structures
 - *Impediment* – un-enforced landlord licensing law

Actions Taken

The City continued the third year of a concentrated code enforcement program, in 2009 located in the Middle City Area from Whitney Avenue to South Avenue - 15th Street to 18th Street. Two City housing inspectors, working under the direction of the Community Development Department have been assigned the duty of concentrated, door to door code enforcement in the above geographic area. The City has also aggressively stepped up its demolition of vacant, condemned structures. Additional CDBG funding and Casino Revenues have been provided for both targeted demolitions and emergency demolitions.

- c. Tax Policies
 - No impediments identified

d. Public Services

- *Impediment* – lack of diversity in the police department
- *Impediment* – lack of significant shopping venues in the high minority and low income areas of the City of Niagara Falls
- *Impediment* – lack of bus routes running from the northern and western end of the City to the eastern retail district

Actions Taken

The City offers financial incentives for minority owned businesses, women owned businesses and micro-enterprise businesses to start or expand business operations. The financial assistance is normally provided in the form of a matching grant and has proven to be a successful tool in encouraging business opportunities for low income minority and women owned businesses. In 2009, no businesses participated in the program. However, this program has historically been well received and the City will continue to offer the program to interested parties.

Diversity in the police department was cited as a problem. The City is currently conducting recruitment and training and providing special outreach to minorities and women to prepare for the police exam. A minority police officer and a female police officer are being utilized to provide training at the local community college. The present police department work force totals 150. There are 137 males of which (4 are African American and 2 are Hispanic. There are 13 females of which 2 are African American, 2 are Hispanic and 1 is American Indian.

e. Planning & Zoning Boards

- *Impediment* - Lack of racial and ethnic diversity on the Planning & Zoning Board

Actions Taken

The Niagara Falls Planning Board currently has 9 members of which one is African American, one American Indian and one woman.

f. Private, Public & Assisted Housing

- *Impediment* – landlords may legally reject applicants due to source of income impacting the Section 8 program
- *Impediment* – lack of private rental housing for persons with disabilities
- Niagara Falls Housing Authority Projects (2) are hyper-segregated with only 5 non-black households among a total of 191 households
- *Impediment* - the Housing Authority's definition of "family" and "functional unit" may constitute a violation of NYS Sexual Orientation Non-Discrimination Act
- *Impediment* – accessible subsidized rental housing to disabled persons is not consistently available
- *Impediment* – four(4) affordable "family" complexes are clustered in the same high poverty area

Actions Taken

The City is the PHA for the Section 8 Leased Housing Program. The PHA addresses fair housing issues with participating families in the Housing Choice briefing. During this session, families are explained their rights to fair housing and are given a copy of HUD's Fair Housing Booklet (HUD 1686-FHEO) and form 903, if the tenant needs to file a fair housing complaint. Tenants are advised of their rights and formal complaints are sent to the City's Human Rights Commissioner. The PHA maintains a list of landlords who are willing to participate in the Section 8 Program. The housing units these landlords own are

located throughout the City. However, landlords are not legally required to participate in the Section 8 program

g. Section 8 Administration

- *Impediment* – absence of a policy for providing exception rents may further high concentration poverty area
- *Impediment* – Section 8 lead regulations may disproportionately affect families with children

Actions Taken

The PHA periodically advertises for the waiting list; a notice is placed in the local print media, and mailed to agencies that assist elderly, disabled, and low-income families. These initiatives addressed the following items identified as impediments to fair Housing in the City's Plan and Analysis:

- Availability and affordability of housing
- Housing quality
- Delivery of brochure services
- Availability of financial assistance

Based upon the current success rates of voucher holders in locating suitable housing, the Section 8 Program has determined that current payment standards are set high enough to allow participants to rent in all areas of Niagara Falls. Exception Rents may also be provided to disabled families as a reasonable accommodation.

The enforcement of lead-based paint regulations may result in a landlord's refusal to participate in the Section 8 Program. Free training is available for landlords to assist them in complying with the regulations

h. Group Homes

- *Impediment* – restrictive licensing fees is a deterrent to opening new transitional housing for recovering alcohol and substance abusers

i. Real Estate Practices

- *Impediment* – lack of information about programs to aid minority and first-time buyers
- *Impediment* – lack of minority real estate brokers and agents
- *Impediment* – lack of procedures to recruit, train minority agents/brokers

Actions Taken

The City in collaboration with Center City Neighborhood Development, Niagara Falls NHS and Highland Community Revitalization has established a first time homebuyer's center that provides counseling, education, credit repair etc, for potential homebuyers. In 2009, 149 individuals participated in the courses offered, 96 clients received credit counseling, 27 received foreclosure counseling, 12 received post purchase counseling and 49 clients actually purchased housing, of which 18 received CDBG assistance.

j. Fair Housing Advertising/Education

- *Impediment* – there is no entity charged with collecting affirmative fair housing marketing plans
- *Impediment* – Local Housing Law needs to be amended
- *Impediment* - lack of fair housing education, outreach, enforcement
- *Impediment* – lack of training and resources for the current fair housing provider
- *Impediment* – Human Rights Commission has not established in-house investigation and testing capabilities

Actions Taken

The City provides Community Development Block Grant funding to the Highland Community Revitalization Committee to advertise, promote and encourage the development of Fair Housing practices in the City. HCRC is required to conduct at least two (2) fair housing seminars each year. In 2009 HCRC conducted two (2) seminars. These seminars provide the public with guest speakers, informative brochures and fair housing literature. HCRC has implemented an extensive advertising campaign to promote fair housing and they have received the benefit of HUD training to further enhance their ability to deliver fair housing services in the City. The seminars were held in convenient, handicapped accessible locations with the intent of providing the public information and guidance relative to Section 808 of the Fair Housing Act and to assess and implement measures to affirmatively further fair housing. HCRC will provide direct advisory and client referral services in response to reported incidents of housing discrimination... HCRC will investigate and monitor the local lending industry for compliance under the fair housing laws and conduct research of local housing markets, and housing providers to assess the effectiveness of fair housing programs

k. Lending & Appraisals

- *Impediment* – rates of denial of government insured conventional mortgages are higher in the City than in suburban areas
- *Impediment* – minorities are denied loans at higher rates than non-minorities
- *Impediment* – predatory loans occur more frequently than for non-minorities of similar incomes

Actions Taken

The Niagara Falls Homeownership Center has developed a close working relationship with local lending institutions to coordinate and develop strategies to provide mortgage assistance to first time homebuyers. Local lenders are well informed of the various financial incentives offered to encourage homeownership.

l. Insurance Policies & Practices

- *Impediment* – credit scoring may contribute to racial disparities

No Action Taken

m. Housing for Persons with Disabilities

- *Impediment* – lack of accessible housing units
- *Impediment* – no effective means to link persons with disabilities with units
- *Impediment* – exclusion of applicants with poor credit can have a disparate impact on persons with disabilities
- *Impediment* - Services for disabled persons not readily available at City Hall

Action Taken

Neighborhood Housing Services, a sub-grantee has reached an agreement with Western New York Center for Independent Living to survey their population of over 400 households with handicapped persons. When completed, the survey will provide hard data on the housing needs of the handicapped population in the community. This information will then be analyzed and appropriate actions taken to address this need.

4. Describe Other Actions in Strategic Plan or Action Plan taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs.

Other Actions Taken to Address Obstacles to Underserved Needs

The City of Niagara Falls has made significant contributions towards increasing affordable housing through its CDBG and HOME funded housing programs. These programs provide funding for housing development, rehabilitation, and first-time homebuyers assistance. The latter has been identified as the City's highest priority need and significant energies and resources have been dedicated to increasing homeownership rates for low and moderate income homebuyers. Code enforcement activities have also been undertaken to address vacant housing issues, unsafe housing conditions and elimination of slums and blight. Concentrated door-to-door code enforcement in targeted geographic areas of the City was continued in 2009.

5. Leveraging Resources

- a. Identify progress in obtaining "other" public and private resources to address needs.
- b. How Federal resources from HUD leveraged other public and private resources.
- c. How matching requirements were satisfied.

Leveraging Resources Accomplishments (also see attached chart)

The City actively encourages the leveraging of other resources for neighborhood development and community projects. Homeowners who are below 80% of median income are provided deferred loans for housing rehabilitation. By placing a lien on the property funds are recycled upon sale or transfer of title to the property. Other housing rehabilitation programs require the owner to provide matching private funds to the federal dollars invested in the project. Also NYS AHC and HTF funding is used to leverage federal funds invested in a project.

The following "other" funding leveraged the federal resources made available to the City. The amounts listed are the significant grants awarded in 2009.

Center City Neighborhood Development Corporation

NYS NPP Grant	\$75,203
NYS DHCR	\$200,000
DHCR Legislative Member Item	\$13,943

Niagara Falls NHS Inc.

NYS NPP Grant	\$75,203
NYS HTF	\$243,000
Neighbor Works	\$26,500
DHCR Legislative Member Item	\$13,943
HUD Counseling Grant	\$40,000
Private donations	\$5,530

Highland Community Revitalization Committee

NYS NPP Grant	\$75,203
---------------	----------

New Jerusalem Boy's Reporting Center

Department of Social Services	\$212,300
-------------------------------	-----------

NFHA Summer Enrichment Program	\$24,577
--------------------------------	----------

Niagara Falls Memorial Medical Center	\$50,000
---------------------------------------	----------

Matching Fund Requirements

The City of Niagara Falls has established a substantial carry-over balance of HOME matching funds as detailed on the HOME Match report, included at the end of this report. The initial 25% match requirement was reduced by half to 12.5%. The City currently has a zero match liability based on it's qualification as a severely distressed community.

Emergency Shelter grant funds require a matching contribution to the ESG funds expended during the program year. This requirement is met by each agency receiving grant funds, through paid staff time, professional volunteer labor calculated at \$10.00 per hour, fixtures and furnishings provided at the shelter, utilities paid etc.

Program Year 5 CAPER General Questions response:

Managing the Process

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to ensure compliance with program and comprehensive planning requirements.

Program Year 5 CAPER Managing the Process response:

The City took actions in 2009 to ensure compliance with program and comprehensive planning requirements. A series of four neighborhood based meetings were held beginning in June 2009 to activate the citizen participation process and to plan for the use of anticipated federal funding in 2010. Citizens were afforded the opportunity to present comments, suggestions and recommendations to the City regarding neighborhood and city-wide priorities and needs. The 2010 Action Plan was developed based on these comments and suggestions. Two public hearings were held during the program year. The first hearing was held for the proposed use of 2010 CDBG, HOME and ESG funding. The second hearing was held to receive comments on the 2009 CAPER report. All meetings were held in convenient, handicapped accessible locations. Notices were published 15 days prior to the hearing in the local print media; comments received were incorporated into and or answered in the final documents submitted to HUD.

Citizen Participation

1. Provide a summary of citizen comments.
2. In addition, the performance report provided to citizens must identify the Federal funds made available for furthering the objectives of the Consolidated Plan. For each formula grant program, the grantee shall identify the total amount of funds available (including estimated program income), the total amount of funds committed during the reporting period, the total amount expended during the reporting period, and the geographic distribution and location of expenditures. Jurisdictions are encouraged to include maps in describing the geographic distribution and location of investment (including areas of minority concentration). The geographic distribution and expenditure requirement may also be satisfied by specifying the census tracts where expenditures were concentrated.

*Please note that Citizen Comments and Responses may be included as additional files within the CPMP Tool.

Program Year 5 CAPER Citizen Participation response:

The City of Niagara Falls provides ample opportunities for citizens to review and comment on the Annual Consolidated Plan and Strategy and the CAPERS Annual Performance Report. Included are the proposed budgets for the Community Development Block Grant, HOME and Emergency Shelter Grant programs. A hard copy of the documents is available in the Office of Community Development located at 1022 Main Street, the Earl Brydges Library at 1225 Main Street and the LaSalle Branch Library at 8728 Buffalo Avenue, all in the City of Niagara Falls. Additionally, the documents are also available at the City's website www.niagarafallsusa.org

Public comments received during the program year are generated as a result of the implementation of the City's consolidated planning process. Neighborhood based meetings are held to generate public input, comments and suggestions. Public hearings are also held to review and receive comments on both the CPS and CAPERS prior to the documents being transmitted to HUD. Included below is a summary of citizen comments received for the 2009 Action Plan and the City's response.

**COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CONSOLIDATED PLAN AND STRATEGY SUMMARY OF 2009
PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES
Wednesday, September 17, 2008, 6:00 p.m.
City Hall – Council Chambers
745 Main Street
Niagara Falls, New York**

Attendees: (sign in sheet attached to minutes)

Jamie Johnson	Ron Anderluh
Leslie Tarczynski	Allen Booker
Diane Ward	Christine Sanborn
Mary Jo Zacher	Nicholas A. D'Agostino
Mark DelMonte	Steve Dojka
Michael Kudela	Thomas Trainor
Patrick Bradley	Patricia Frederick
Bob Kostoff	Mark Smith
Frank Maietta	Bob Miller
Dave Taylor	Mark Montazzoli
Jerry Genova	Jim Szwedo
Susan Delorenzo	Richard Hastings
Eric Fields	Laurie Davis
Council Chairman Samuel Fruscione	

Staff Present:

Robert Antonucci
MaryAnn Colangelo
Gail Bimont
James Marasco

The public hearing began at 6:00 p.m. Mr. Antonucci welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained that the purpose of the meeting was to conduct a public hearing for the proposed 2009 Community Development, HOME and Emergency Shelter Grant Annual Plan.

Everyone in the audience received a copy of the draft budget.

Mr. Antonucci stated that the City receives approximately \$2.5 million in Community Development Block Grant funds, plus approximately \$400,000 in program income. The City receives approximately \$550,000 in HOME funds and \$110,000 in Emergency Shelter Grant funds.

He stated that after his review of the budgets he invited the public to come forward with their comments, suggestions or recommendations for the budget. He stated that all comments would be recorded and reviewed with the Mayor and City Council.

Mr. Antonucci continued that after the public hearing there is a 30-day review period that is required by HUD. The public has an additional 30 days from the public hearing to submit comments in writing on the budget. The entire annual plan is available for public review at the two public libraries or at the Community Development office at 1022 Main Street. Once it is approved and adopted it will be on the City's website.

Mr. Antonucci did a line by line review of the proposed budget and handout. He explained each program activity and the funding allocated to each activity for the CDBG, HOME and ESG budgets (see attached FY' 2009 Action Plan handout that was reviewed).

After the budget review, Mr. Antonucci opened the meeting to public comment.

Ron Anderluh, -, Revitalization Coordinator of the Niagara Street Business Association. The following is a summary of comments made by Mr. Anderluh: I am the Niagara Street Business Association Revitalization Coordinator, I also sit on the Board of the YMCA, NHS and Niagara USA Chamber, I am also involved with the Weed and Seed Community and the Buffalo Avenue Brownfield Commission. I would like to thank Community Development and their staff for monies allocated for Weed and Seed. As you know, we are trying to do another application for the South end and within that application we put in for a police substation. We are trying to locate the substation at 1901 Niagara Street. Thank you for the two police officers. We would like to see additional police officers in those substations. I don't know if there is other money available from other agencies for this but we would like to see additional officers. Thank you for the money allocated for the Echota area. Thank you for the continued funding of NHS. I would like to see the façade program boundary areas expanded. Especially on Niagara Street to include the east and west sides of 24th Street, east and west sides of Portage Road and the east and west sides of 19th Street and Hyde Park Boulevard between Ferry and Buffalo Avenue. There are several new businesses that have opened in those areas. I am glad the Fire Education Coordinator is in the budget. That position is a very good thing for the school age kids. The YMCA is always in need of money and we would appreciate your help there.

Mr. Anderluh stated that he would like to see the Revitalization Coordinator position and two surveillance cameras for 19th and Niagara Street put back in the budget. He talked about it being a high crime area. I don't put anything in front of public safety. I believe in parks, but we are putting \$75,000 into a park that will be temporary. I know we need parks for kids but I don't agree with this (South Jr. Park). We did the same thing with a mini park that we had on Portage and East Falls. Once we put the little park in the City sold it to NFR. The same thing could happen at South, Jr. We need two cameras for public safety on Niagara Street. Pine Avenue put in for five cameras. Between our cameras and the 19th Street cameras they could probably cover almost all of 19th Street and the other camera would cover Niagara Street down three blocks.

Mr. Anderluh stated that the other area of concern was the exclusion of Revitalization Coordinators for all the business districts. He said the stipend of \$12,000 went a long way. He stated that he goes to just about every City meeting as well as being involved in other community organizations. He stated that he realizes it was only suppose to be funded for three years but it is very important to have a liaison between the City and the community. I am asking on behalf of all three Revitalization Coordinators.

Bob Kostoff, Vice President of the Niagara Street Business Association – He stated that he wanted to second everything Mr. Anderluh said. He gave a history of the Revitalization Coordinator position stating that it was developed by Fran Scarfone. It is a community position and the benefit that is received from this \$12,000 position is equivalent to spending \$75,000 or \$80,000 on other things. I believe \$12,000 is a fairly small sum when

compared with some of the other budget items. Considering the benefit that is received from those funds it is so worthwhile that it should be included.

Mary Jo Zacher read and submitted for the record the following statement – My name is Mary Jo Zacher and I am the Executive Director of the Pine Avenue Business Association (PABA). The goal of PABA is to keep Pine Avenue a thriving business district and a social and cultural tourist destination. We were devastated when we saw the proposed budget from the CD office. We requested \$15,000 for the Revitalization Coordinator position; the role of the Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinator is a very important role, especially in the Pine Avenue area. Pine Avenue is a thriving business district that is attracting new businesses while maintaining its established veteran businesses. The tax base on Pine Avenue is one of the largest in Niagara Falls and contributes to the health and wealth of the City. Last year we allocated \$50,000 for security cameras. We are asking for an additional \$50,000 to add additional cameras. Niagara Falls is no longer an industrial City but now has to focus on tourism as the support system for our City. Along with tourism, we need specialty shops and businesses for them to visit and perhaps extend their stay. Unfortunately, in order to do this we need to place security camera's in the surrounding areas. One of the areas that we were targeting is the City Market. When I was growing up in Niagara Falls, the Market was the hub of the City. It was the place to be! We want to allow the people in the community and visitors with a safe and secure environment so that they may enjoy the wonderful produce and activities at the market, and patronize the long-standing businesses. Last we requested \$1,000 for a website to help generate economic development and allow developers and businesspersons to access information for the façade program and other incentives available through the City. We are asking you to reconsider the funding allocation in this budget to include some of the requests from PABA. Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to present my concerns and requests.

Mark DeMonte, Vice President of PABA – I would like to support Mary Jo's statement. We need CD support and we would appreciate you reconsidering the budget. Thank you.

Jerry Genova, President of PABA – I hope that you will take a good look at what Mary Jo has proposed. It is very important not just to the PABA but to the community itself.

Mark Montazzoli read and submitted for the read the following statement. My name is Mark Montazzoli. I am President of the Board of Directors of the Niagara Falls Neighborhood Housing Services Corporation (also known as NHS). Our offices are located at 479 – 16th Street, Niagara Falls, New York 14303. NHS wishes to express our appreciation to the City of Niagara Falls in general and the Community Development Department specifically for the continuing support that you have provided us in our neighborhood revitalization efforts. NHS and the City have been partners in the fight to reduce blight in our neighborhood for almost 30 years know. While conditions are far from perfect, we have been a stabilizing force in the neighborhood between Portage Road and 39th Street. We have succeeded in leveraging the City's funds with other State and private dollars and we have accepted the mission from the City to better concentrate our revitalization initiatives in smaller target areas within our neighborhood. With the City's help, we hope to attack the blighting influences in our neighborhood moving west from Hyde Park Boulevard. We hope that our partnership can continue for decades to come. There is no doubt that without our partnership and the money brought in from State and private sources our neighborhood would be far worse off. We know that there is a great demand for Community Development funds, but as one last line of defenses against encroaching blight in our neighborhood, we hope that we will always receive some level of priority from you to continue our work. In addition to that, I also want to echo what you have been hearing tonight as far as the revitalization coordinator being a critical position. That too feeds the whole process of making change that is much needed for this area. Without it I think it would be a detriment. We have also asked that you review the cost/benefit analysis when comparing agencies in our arena to

really see where you are getting your bang for the buck. Who is delivering more than the other, per se. How, many homes have been put back on the tax rolls and who is improving the level of housing stock in the area as well. Thank you for your support and time.

Nick D'Agostino, 2224 Welch Avenue – Mr. D'Agostino stated that he was on the Board of Directors of NHS and on the Steering Committee for the Weed and Seed Program and he is a member of the communities Emergency Response Team. Mr. D'Agostino expressed his support the Police Substation and security cameras in the 19th Street Niagara Street area. He felt they were a very important addition to the area. He expressed his supported having additional officers at the Police Substation. He thanked CD for the work that was done on Gill Creek Park.

Laurie Davis, 1316 – 24th Street, - Ms. Davis stated she was present as a resident but she is also an immediate past president of the Niagara Falls Kiwanis Club Board, treasurer of the MSBA, serves on the City's Tourism and Advisory Board and is a life member of the Friends of Local History and treasurer of the local Belleview Local Development Corp., which is overseeing construction of the court house. Ms. Davis submitted and read for the record the following statement: As a life long resident of the City of Niagara Falls I have seen many changes. As a member of the business community on Main Street for close to 30 years I have watched its gradual decline. As an active member of the MSBA I have worked with many others for the past ten years to improve the quality of life for the businesses and residents alike. It has never once been easy. Most of the work has been done through the dedicated commitment of volunteers. Many of the people in this community are dedicated to the same goal of community revitalization and countless hours are contributed to assist the efforts of city employees and elected officials. There is only so much volunteers can do and with limited resources groups have to rely on outside funding. We have been fortunate enough to have financial assistance from the City of Niagara Falls through the Department of Community Development. This funding has enabled us to pay someone for 50 hours per month to work with the volunteers on improving the quality of life. Through the efforts of the late Fran Scarfone the business associations in this City and the surrounding areas have worked together for many years for the improvement of our entire community. We have been able to maintain these partnerships largely because of the funding available to help each organization have a Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinator. These people have been responsible for promoting and informing businesses and potential business about the numerous economic development programs available to them as well as dealing with many other concerns. This past year Pine Avenue, Main Street and the Downtown Business Associations collaborated on a project to beautify and unify the business districts by placing hanging baskets of live plants along Pine Avenue, Main and Third Streets. This effort was labor intensive and costly but well worth the effort as it made a visible difference in the appearance of our City. Funding for all these locations was obtained by applying for and being awarded grant money through the County of Niagara and the Niagara Falls Bridge Commission. Each of us were responsible for matching funds to this grant and through fund raising and membership we contributed a significant amount of money to make this happen. With the contribution of the City of Niagara Falls to keep the plants watered this was a successful project. With the recognition that industry can no longer support our city and the realization that tourism can, and should, it is crucial that we also get our City prepared visitors. The impression they have when they visit here will determine if they return and for how long they will stay which directly affects our local economy. The Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinator allows all of our organizations to make a more concentrated effort in the areas of beautification, affordable housing, reporting and removing blighted conditions, advocating for better public safety, façade improvements and overall economic development. In every area of our city there is a need for a better quality of life. I honestly believe that we are headed in the right direction and physical improvements are noticeable everywhere but this is an on-going, continuous battle. All of these projects take time and a dedicated person, more than can be expected of volunteers. I am aware that funding for these positions was not meant to be eternal but for numerous reasons the need

for this service is still great. I have every belief in the turnaround of this city and everywhere there is evidence of this beginning to happen. With the new municipal complex being built on Main Street this is a crucial time in our organization and the loss of funding for this position will have a serious negative impact on our revitalization work. I am respectfully asking that the positions of Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinators be restored to our business associations so that we may continue to finish what so many of us have started. If an alternative source of funding can be identified, and that funding is not bound by the requirements of HUD, I respectfully ask that the area of LaSalle be included in the funding also.

Thomas Trainor, President of MSBA – Mr. Trainor stated that all our business associations agree that our quality of life issues are very important. I always harp with our group that it is the little things like keeping the trash picked up and the windows washed and a security presence that can make a neighborhood thrive. Our Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinator has been our lead person in getting neighborhood issues addressed. The impressive community knowledge that a person, such as Norma Higgs, has makes an enormous impact. He noted that the backbone of revitalization efforts will be small business owners and how well they can do in these difficult neighborhoods. I think there is a real need for the coordination of struggling and prospective enclaves with developing resources. Our neighborhood development coordinators have helped to that end. We want to continue the momentum that we have on Main Street and we feel that the retention of the Neighborhood Development Coordinator is very important. We also have had a good amount of interest in the façade program and we would like to market that further. I would be very interested in working with the other business associations to pool our resources and develop a more creative way of doing these activities in our neighborhood and the City as a whole. He talked about the activities of Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinator stressing the importance of the position to the community and business district.

Patrick Bradley, Director of Marketing and Public Relations, Niagara Falls Memorial Medical Center – Mr. Bradley thanked CD staff and the City Administrator for the continued and past support that NFMHC has received in the past several years. He updated everyone on Schoellkopf Park and talked about the success of that project. We understand that CD funds are limited for 2009 and the focus seems to be on street and sidewalk replacement, demo's, etc. He stated that he wanted to bring to the attention a project that was not included in the budget. The project is a \$200,000 neighborhood improvement project that would establish a 45 space surface parking lot on 10th Street directly across the street from the new ER 1 Heart Center of Niagara. Of that \$200,000 project we are requesting \$150,000 of CDBG funding. NFMHC commitment is \$50,000 plus money that we have already spent to purchase properties at 550, 552 and 562 10th Street and the adjoining property at 923 Walnut Avenue. We propose to demolish all of those properties to clear and pave those neighboring properties, fence them and landscape them in an aesthetically pleasing manner and provide 45 parking spaces to service low/mod income patients including the elderly. This project will benefit the entire community, demolish four dilapidated houses, two of which were abandoned when we purchased them and provide parking for the elderly and those with mobility issues. It will also tie into our entire housing neighborhood improvement program, a program supported by several organizations. He talked about the amount of investment that has been put into the hospital area. We respectfully ask you to review and reconsider our application for the greater good of our community and the patients that we serve.

Eric Fields, Resource Supervisor for the Doris Jones Resource Building. I am here to speak on behalf of the Niagara Falls Housing Authority After School Program. Over the past year CD has supported the after school programs. Unfortunately, we are not in the budget this year. We wanted to let you know what type of services that we provide. These services will be hindered without the funding. Kids come into the facility from schools all over the City. They come to the

center for extra help in terms of homework, guidance and a safe environment. Some of the kids don't get at home the services we provide, which leaves them out on the street in a negative environment. Some of the parents who are trying to go to school or are trying to do things right are hindered without a safe place for their kids. In the end if we don't reach out a try and provide help and invest resources for kids we will end up seeing the need for more police officers, etc., in the future. We would ask that the City re-look at this project and reconsider funding for the after school program.

Leslie Tarczynski – MSBA – I am here to support our Board members who spoke but I also want to express support for the small business owners who have hung in there on Main Street. She expressed her support the Neighborhood Development Coordinator position. She felt it was an important position to help move the area forward.

Mark Smith –East Side Block Club – I am here to speak specifically on one issue -- the proposed Police Substation at 19th and Niagara Street. He talked about attending a gang violence workshop and only one area in Niagara Falls that is the main corridor for gang activity and that is two blocks from either side of 19th Street from end to end. When you staff a police substation with two-thirds of an officer, gang response is that we can work around that. Personally I think that two officers should be at each of the sub-stations but I don't know where the funding for that would come from. If there is a priority for additional officers, it should be along the major gang corridor as identified by the Niagara Falls Police Department, which would be the 19th Street station. We need a full time police officer solution not a part time one.

Diane Ward – CEO and founder of the Safe Haven Supervised Visitation Center of Niagara. I was surprised to see that our center was not included in the budget. We had a vision for a center in Niagara Falls. Currently, there is not a safe place in Niagara Falls or Niagara County for parents to see their children whether it is through divorce, domestic violence or substance abuse, etc. Currently, all the centers available are not accessible through public transportation. They have to travel to Tonawanda or Buffalo. Ms. Ward stated that out of her own pocket she has personally financed the center. All the staff has been volunteering their time. All I am asking for is a little bit of help to keep this dream alive. She said that she sits on the board of Planned Parenthood and is the President of Fellowship House Foundation and it amazes her that something so important as connecting families together was not that important to be in the budget. I just want a little bit of help so that we can keep the center going, because there is not one in Niagara Falls. We have parents that drive from Wayne County two hours away to see there children. The program is working and we have proved that it is working. All we are asking for is some kind of help because the children are our future and because they are going through such a difficult time. We are trying to help them to go on to bigger and better things. She stated they are starting a children's domestic violence group of children who have witnessed and been a part of domestic violence in the home. She stated that other agencies have waiting lists and they are open for business. She said she put her money where her mouth was and has proved that the program has worked. She asked that CD please reconsider the funding request.

Bob Miller, President of the Echota Block Club – He thanked CD and the staff for the funding in the budget for the Echota area. He said that they would like to have the Revitalization Coordinator position restored. He said the Ron Anderluh does and great job. They would also like to have Hyde Park Blvd. façade target area extended all the way to Hyde Park Boulevard, including Royal Avenue. He thanked CD again for all their support.

There being no further comments the public hearing concluded at 7:20 p.m.

Mr. Antonucci thanked everyone for their attendance and reminded the audience again there is a 30 day review period where additional comments concerning the budget could be submitted in writing.

2009 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ANNUAL PLAN & BUDGET
RESPONSE TO PUBLIC COMMENTS

COMMENTS RECEIVED AT THE 9/17/08 PUBLIC HEARING THAT REQUIRE CITY RESPONSE:

Public Hearing Comments

- I. **Ron Anderluh and Bob Kostoff – Niagara Street Business Association** – requested that funding for the Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinators be restored to the budget and that reconsideration be given to funding the placement of security cameras at the 19th Street/Niagara Street intersection.
City Response – the Mayor will request that City Council provide funding from Casino revenues to fund the Neighborhood Coordinator positions under the auspices of furthering economic development opportunities in the City. In regards to the security cameras, Community Development funds were previously provided for security cameras for the Pine/19th Street area on a pilot basis. Pending the outcome of that pilot program which is still in the formative stage, and after measuring the success of said program, additional funding may be considered in the future for other areas of the City. At this point we have nothing to evaluate and will not be able to do so until the pilot program is in place.

- II. **Mary Jo Zacher, Mark Delmonte, Jerry Genova – Pine Avenue Business Association**
requested that funding for the Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinators be restored to the budget and that reconsideration be given to funding the placement of security cameras in the City Market Area.
City Response – the Mayor will request that City Council provide funding from Casino revenues to fund the Neighborhood Coordinator positions under the auspices of furthering economic development opportunities in the City. In regards to the security cameras, Community Development funds were previously provided for security cameras for the Pine/19th Street area on a pilot basis. Pending the outcome of that pilot program which is still in the formative stage, and after measuring the success of said program, additional funding may be considered in the future for other areas of the City. At this point we have nothing to evaluate and will not be able to do so until the pilot program is in place

- III. **Laurie Davis, Thomas Trainor – Main Street Business Association**
requested that funding for the Neighborhood Revitalization Coordinators be restored to the budget
City Response – the Mayor will request that City Council provide funding from Casino revenues to fund the Neighborhood Coordinator positions under the auspices of furthering economic development opportunities in the City.

- IV. **Patrick Bradley – Niagara Falls Memorial Medical Center** – requested that the City reconsider the request to assist in the creation of a parking lot for the medical center's emergency facility \$150,000 is requested to include demolition of 3 blighted properties, paving and landscaping of the vacant lot for parking.
City Response: The City has re-evaluated this proposal and \$150,000 in CDBG funds will be budgeted for this project in the 2009 Annual Plan

- V. **Erick Fields – Niagara Falls Housing Authority** – requested that the City reconsider funding in the amount of \$15,000 for the housing authority's Summer Enrichment Program providing academic, social and cultural services to school age children from throughout the City.

City Response: - The City has re-evaluated this proposal and \$15,000 in CDBG funds will be budgeted for this project in the 2009 Annual Plan

- VI. **Diane Ward – Safe Haven Supervised Visitation** – requested that the City reconsider her application for funding to assist with the supervised child/parent visitation program that currently operates with her own funding and volunteers. Services are provided for parents to see children in a safe environment as a result of divorce, domestic violence or substance abuse.

City Response: The City has re-evaluated this proposal and \$12,500 in CDBG funds will be budgeted for this project in the 2009 Annual Plan

Institutional Structure

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to overcome gaps in institutional structures and enhance coordination.

Program Year 5 CAPER Institutional Structure response:

The City of Niagara Falls continued to collaborate and further develop its relationships with federal, state and local leaders, funding agents, community advocates, block club organizations, businesspersons, service providers and other community groups. The City performed an evaluation of its housing programs and neighborhood revitalization delivery system in conjunction with the development of the 5-year Consolidated Plan and Strategy. In order to overcome gaps in the institutional structure and to more efficiently and effectively deliver programs and services to the community, the City undertook a re-organization of the Community Development Department. This re-organization affected the City and its sub-grantees with the intent of attaining the following goals and objectives:

- Increase community participation in the Block Grant process.
- Increase the transparency and accountability of the CDBG program.
- Strengthen the Neighborhood Development Corporations.
- Strengthen the role of the Block Club Council.
- Create more effective service delivery systems.
- Eliminate duplication and overlaps in services.
- Increase revitalization work productivity.
- Increase the emphasis on creating new homeownership opportunities for low income citizens of the community

Monitoring

1. Describe how and the frequency with which you monitored your activities.
2. Describe the results of your monitoring including any improvements.
3. Self Evaluation
 - a. Describe the effect programs have in solving neighborhood and community problems.
 - b. Describe progress in meeting priority needs and specific objectives and help make community's vision of the future a reality.
 - c. Describe how you provided decent housing and a suitable living environment and expanded economic opportunity principally for low and moderate-income persons.
 - d. Indicate any activities falling behind schedule.
 - e. Describe how activities and strategies made an impact on identified needs.
 - f. Identify indicators that would best describe the results.
 - g. Identify barriers that had a negative impact on fulfilling the strategies and overall vision.
 - h. Identify whether major goals are on target and discuss reasons for those that are not on target.
 - i. Identify any adjustments or improvements to strategies and activities that might meet your needs more effectively.

Program Year 5 CAPER Monitoring response:

The City monitors and evaluates performance with a monthly review of our project status report which details all funds (CDBG, HOME, ESG and Program Income) according to funding commitment date and obligation date, status of funds expended and completion of activities. The City has implemented a procedure to re-program funds for projects that are delinquent in meeting timeliness requirements. In addition, the City performs an annual monitoring visit to evaluate program compliance and financial status for each of its housing sub-recipients.

The City of Niagara Falls has administered the federal Community Development Block Grant, HOME and Emergency Shelter Grant programs in conformance with the strategies outlined in the Consolidated Plan and with the regulations as set forth at 24CFR Part 91. Community Development Block Grant funds were expended in 2009 at a rate that meet the timeliness test imposed by HUD. The City took great efforts to accomplish this goal and implemented the appropriate measures to re-program funds to comply with the timeliness deadline. This will be an on-going process whereby projects will be more critically evaluated to meet performance standards before they are funded by the City. This includes firm commitments of other financing necessary to complete the project.

The City has expanded programs designed to address the needs identified in our Consolidated Plan and we have consistently met the 70% test for benefiting low/mod income persons. The City has maintained an administrative funding level below the allowable percentage cap.

The City has not deviated from the activities or strategies outlined in the plan which was developed from extensive public input through the Citizen Participation process. The City's Citizen Participation Plan has been strictly adhered to in terms of adequately informing the major stakeholders of the planned use of federal resources, performance reporting and amendment procedures.

The activities and strategies identified in the Plan are making positive improvements to our neighborhoods and to our community as a whole. Housing rehabilitation and homeownership opportunities have received favorable funding consideration and continue to be a top priority in the City. Housing activities have been designed to meet the needs of our low-income citizens by providing services in a flexible, fair and equitable manner. The geographic distribution of funds is sensitive to neighborhood needs. Every attempt has been made to leverage federal dollars with private and other public resources.

Economic Development and job creation projects are identified as high priorities in our Consolidated Plan. The City has had significant success in funding projects that have created and retained jobs for low and moderate income households. The job creation narrative, which is attached to this report, details the jobs created individually by project.

Results of Monitoring/Improvements: The City's Economic Development program monitoring has been turned over to the Department of Community Development. There are no new economic development projects planned with CDBG funds as casino revenues have replaced CDBG funding. However, there are several open activities that lack total job creation quotas and those activities will be monitored until compliance is achieved. A CD staff person has been assigned to monitor the progress of the remaining open activities. Loan recipients that are delinquent in creating jobs with no apparent plan to meet the desired goals will be sent letters by CD Legal Counsel informing them that are in default of the terms of the loan provided and the issue must be brought to resolution.

Lead-based Paint

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to evaluate and reduce lead-based paint hazards.

Program Year 5 CAPER Lead-based Paint response:

The City of Niagara Falls has developed a lead-based paint (lbp) hazard control program in conjunction with the federally financed housing rehabilitation programs offered by the City and its sub-grantees. The hazard control program includes the evaluation of the conditions and content of painted surfaces in housing, the training of staff members in the preparation of specifications designed to eradicate these hazards, providing information to homeowners, landlords and tenants to make them aware of the hazards of lbp and the training of contractors to enable them to perform hazard control work using safe work practices. Once lbp hazards are eliminated in a home, clearance testing is conducted with the ultimate goal to provide a lead-safe housing environment.

Additionally the City has partnered with Lead Connections, to provide an innovative partnership of private, public, local and national organization dedicated to lead safe housing in Western New York. Lead Connections provides at no charge to eligible participants maintenance training, paint and materials, plastic sheeting for containing dust, cleaners and cleaning supplies, a list of contractors who offer discount rates, risk assessment and inspections, equipment rentals – hand tools and HEAP-filtered vacuums, and presumptive inspection – free property assessment to determine needs

Training classes are held each month at the Lead Connection Office, 346 Austin Street, Buffalo, NY 14207.

HOUSING

Housing Needs

Describe Actions taken during the last year to foster and maintain affordable housing.

Program Year 5 CAPER Housing Needs response:

In the 5-Year Consolidated Plan and Strategy adopted in 2005, the City identified specific housing needs and impediments to developing affordable housing for the City's low and moderate income population. The City committed to investing in residential housing rehabilitation based on a targeted approach to achieve neighborhood revitalization. Additionally, recognizing that federal funds provided to the City would not be sufficient to fully achieve these stated goals, significant efforts were expected to secure other state and local funding to compliment the CDBG and HOME federal allocations. The City took the initiative to identify new homeownership as the number one priority in the 5-year plan and additionally identified areas of continued collaboration among key housing providers within the institutional structure at the federal, state and local levels.

In order to address the need to increase homeownership rates, the City and sub-grantees aggressively implemented several closing cost/down payment initiatives whereby income eligible first time homebuyer could receive up to \$2,500 in closing cost grants using CDBG funds. 49 first time homeowners purchased homes in 2009; of which 18 received CDBG closing cost assistance.

The City's three housing sub-grantees have established a strong working relationship with the State Division of Housing and Community Renewal and the NYS Affordable Housing Corporation. In addition to receiving NPP grants for program administration costs, the sub-grantees have successfully applied for and received affordable housing grants from NYS Affordable Housing Corp. (AHC), NYS Housing Trust Fund (HTF), and NYS DHCR (State HOME funds). The receipt of the aforementioned grants has significantly enhanced their ability to provide a comprehensive housing rehabilitation program while leveraging other funding resources.

The City continues to prioritize housing rehabilitation as a high priority need and has executed contracts with neighborhood based sub-grantees in excess of \$1 million using CDBG and HOME funding. All homes rehabilitated through these programs receive a lead based paint risk assessment and corrective measures are incorporated into the rehabilitation work plan

Specific Housing Objectives

1. Evaluate progress in meeting specific objective of providing affordable housing, including the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income renter and owner households comparing accomplishments with proposed goals during the reporting period.
2. Evaluate progress in providing affordable housing that meets the Section 215 definition of affordable housing for rental and owner households comparing actual accomplishments with proposed goals during the reporting period.
3. Describe efforts to address "worst-case" housing needs and housing needs of persons with disabilities.

Program Year 5 CAPER Specific Housing Objectives response: Below is the Section 215 Affordable Housing Completion Goals

TABLE 3B ANNUAL HOUSING COMPLETION GOALS					
ANNUAL AFFORDABLE RENTAL HOUSING GOALS (SEC. 215)	Annual Expected Number Completed	Resources used during the period			
		CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA
Acquisition of existing units		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>
Production of new units	3	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>
Rehabilitation of existing units	9	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rental Assistance	1,000	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>
Total Sec. 215 Rental Goals	1,011	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ANNUAL AFFORDABLE OWNER HOUSING GOALS (SEC. 215)					
Acquisition of existing units		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
Production of new units		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>		
Rehabilitation of existing units	80	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
Homebuyer Assistance	24	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>
Total Sec. 215 Owner Goals	104	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ANNUAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING GOALS (SEC. 215)					
Homeless	800	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Non-Homeless		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Special Needs		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Total Sec. 215 Affordable Housing	800	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
ANNUAL HOUSING GOALS					
Annual Rental Housing Goal	1,011	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Annual Owner Housing Goal	104	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Total Annual Housing Goal	1,115	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

The chart below shows the **actual** 2009 housing program beneficiaries by racial/ethnic data and by income group based on completed units:

Racial/Ethnic Characteristics	SF Rehab # of Units	MF Rehab # of Units	Closing Costs # of Units	Total units	% by race
White	39	15	16	70	76%
Black/African American	12	8	2	22	24%
Asian	0	0	0	0	0.0%
American Indian	0	0	0	0	0.0%
Native Hawaiian	0	0	0	0	0.0%
Amer. Indian/Alaska Native & White	0	0	0	0	0.0%
Asian & White	0	0	0	0	0.0%
Black/African American & White	0	0	0	0	0.0%
Total	51	23	18	92	100.0%

Income Characteristics	SF Rehab households	MF Rehab households	Closing Costs households	Total households by income	% by income
Low Income	17	10	7	34	37%
Low/Moderate Income	34	13	11	58	63%
Total	51	23	18	92	100%

Housing Accomplishments:

Homeownership Assistance: The provision of homeownership assistance was identified as the number one priority in the City’s 5-year Consolidated Plan and Strategy. 149 clients participated in the homeownership training classes purchased homes of which 49 became homeowners (18 received CDBG closing cost grants), The goal of having 100 clients participate in homeownership counseling classes was met and exceeded as 149 clients participated.

Single Family Housing Rehabilitation: The City projected that 80 single family housing units would be completed in 2009 using CDBG and HOME funding. A total of 51 units were actually completed in 2009. The estimated units will need to be revised in future years as environmental requirements such as asbestos abatement and lead based paint containment reduces the number of units that can be completed. A sizeable amount of funding must be dedicated to meet those requirements and it does restrict our ability to achieve unit completions as had been accomplished in the past.

Rental Housing: The City projected that 9 existing rental units would be rehabilitated and completed in 2009. The City exceeded its goal by completing 23 units in IDIS in 2009, providing safe, decent and affordable housing to low income and low/mod income tenants in the City.. .

Efforts to Address “worst case” Needs and Housing Needs of Persons with Disabilities

The City of Niagara Falls continues to review and analyze to better meet the needs of the under-served and address “worst case” housing needs through housing programs, supportive services and homeless service providers. The under-served are assisted through the City’s Section 8 Leased Housing program and supportive services through the CDBG and ESG programs.

- **Substandard Housing:** Households that have been living in substandard housing prior to entering into the Section 8 Program are ensured of standard living conditions by virtue of compliance with Housing Quality Standards (HQS) that are strictly enforced in the program. Rental units must pass inspection prior to housing assistance contracts being executed with the landlord. Subsequent, annual inspections ensure continued compliance with HQS. The CDBG and HOME funded housing rehabilitation programs mandate compliance with New York State Building Code. City Building Inspectors assigned to the Community Development Department conduct both initial and progress inspections on work being performed by contractors for income eligible homeowners and landlords receiving CDBG or HOME assistance.
- **Housing for Persons with Disabilities:** The City through its partnership with local non-profit homeless service providers, targets persons with mental health issues and disabilities. Fellowship House provides transitional housing to persons with mental health issues and to recovering alcohol/drug dependent persons. Odallam Inc also provides transitional housing to persons with severe mental health issues. Both agencies provide counseling and support in the facilities they operate in the City as well as the remainder of the County.

Neighborhood Housing Services Inc, a local non-profit housing provider, and a CDBG sub-recipient is working in partnership with Independent Living Center of Niagara County to develop a program to meet the underserved needs of persons with disabilities. NHS has reached an agreement with Western New York Center for Independent Living to survey their population of over 400 households with handicapped persons. When completed, the survey will provide hard data on the housing needs of the handicapped population in the community. This information will then be analyzed an appropriate actions taken to address this need

Public Housing Strategy

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to improve public housing and resident initiatives.

Program Year 5 CAPER Public Housing Strategy response:

The City of Niagara Falls supported Public Housing in 2009 by funding various initiatives proposed by the Niagara Falls Housing Authority. \$15,000 was provided to help defray the costs associated with the Housing Authority’s Summer Enrichment Program. This program is designed to be a comprehensive summer program that provides individualized educational, social, cultural and recreational components geared to each child’s level of learning. Over 166 young persons participated in the program in 2009. .Additionally, the City has committed \$3 million (\$1 million annually, for a three-year period) in support of the Niagara Falls Housing Authority’s HOPE VI grant application

Barriers to Affordable Housing

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to eliminate barriers to affordable housing.

Program Year 5 CAPER Barriers to Affordable Housing response:

Homeownership Incentives:

The City's Homeownership Center opened on March 1, 2005, as a "one-stop" home purchase location that is able to connect prospective owners with all the homeownership resources and information available. It is a source of assistance to low and middle income families who may need Homebuyer Education Certification to qualify for mortgages, to access credit counseling, or to someday access low interest-rate mortgage lending through the Center itself. In 2009, 149 individuals enrolled in the homebuyer education/counseling certificate program. 49 clients actually purchase homes in 2009; 18 received closing cost assistance through the City CDBG program. In addition to homebuyer education, the Home Center provided foreclosure intervention counseling to 27 clients, credit counseling to 96 clients and post purchase counseling to 12 clients.

The City of Niagara Falls Leased Housing Program offers a Homeownership option to current Section 8 Participants who meet certain eligibility requirements. Instead of using the voucher subsidy to help families with rent, the homeownership option allows a first-time homeowner to use the voucher subsidy to meet monthly homeownership expenses. Under this option, the homeowner is responsible for finding an eligible property to purchase.

Affordability Compliance

The City continues to monitor rehabilitated HOME units to ensure compliance with regulatory affordability periods.

Rental Assistance

The City will continue to administer the Section 8 Housing Choice Voucher Program to provide assistance to very-low and low-income households to enable them to rent safe, decent and affordable housing in the private market

HOME/ American Dream Down Payment Initiative (ADDI)

(ADDI INITIATIVE) NOT APPLICABLE

1. Assessment of Relationship of HOME Funds to Goals and Objectives
 - a. Evaluate progress made toward meeting goals for providing affordable housing using HOME funds, including the number and types of households served.
2. HOME Match Report
 - a. Use HOME Match Report HUD-40107-A to report on match contributions for the period covered by the Consolidated Plan program year.
3. HOME MBE and WBE Report
 - a. Use Part III of HUD Form 40107 to report contracts and subcontracts with Minority Business Enterprises (MBE) and Women's Business Enterprises (WBE).

4. Assessments

- a. Detail results of on-site inspections of rental housing.
- b. Describe the HOME jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions.
- c. Describe outreach to minority and women owned businesses.

Program Year 5 CAPER HOME/ADDI response:

The "Summary of Resources and Program Accomplishment" chart, included as an attachment to this document, outlines the priority needs established as a result of the development of the 2009 Consolidated Plan and outlines the established funding levels, dollars committed and expended, number of persons/households assisted and low/mod income benefit during the reporting period.

Distribution of HOME Funds in Relationship to CPS Needs

The City of Niagara Falls prepared a 2009 Action Plan that covers the period of January 1, 2009 through December 31, 2009. HOME funds have been budgeted and expended pursuant to the high priority needs identified in the CPS. Homeownership opportunities and rental housing for low income households have been particularly emphasized.

Existing Homeowner Rehabilitation (HOME)

Homeowners qualify for assistance with household income at or below 80% of median income. The program is offered in targeted areas of the City; all homes are rehabilitated according to NYS Building Code and HQS standards. Lead safe housing utilizing safe work practices are incorporated into each project. In 2009 the use of HOME funds for homeowner rehabilitation programs continued as a significant funding source to rehabilitate housing units to meet NYS Building Code requirements. The owner occupied rehabilitation program is offered by the City, Center City Neighborhood Development Corp and Niagara Falls NHS Inc. 19 HOME units were completed in IDIS in 2009. 27 new units of HOME assisted housing were obligated in 2009.

Rental Housing (HOME)

Rental Housing assistance is provided to projects that offer rental units for families at or below either 60% of MFI or 50% of MFI depending on the number of units rehabilitated. The program is offered in targeted areas of the City; homes are rehabilitated according to NYS Building Code and HQS standards. Lead safe work practices are incorporated into each project. In 2009 23 units of HOME rental housing were completed in IDIS.

Outreach Strategy for MBE/WBE Businesses

The City's Community Development Department has established procedures to identify and solicit participation by minority and women owned businesses in the HOME and CDBG housing programs. The City advertises in the local print media, on an annual basis regarding the availability of contracting opportunities for MBE/WBE business concerns. A copy of the advertisement is attached to this report. The City is also considering lowering the minimum insurance requirements for MBE and WBE firms to encourage more contracting opportunities. This has been identified as an obstacle to participation by MBE & WBE businesses. Several businesses have submitted contractor qualifying applications that are currently under review.

The Highland Community Revitalization Committee, with funding provided by the City, has assumed the responsibilities for coordinating fair housing initiatives and minority business outreach. A copy of the flyer announcing free minority business counseling services, workshops and seminars is included as an attachment to this document.

HOME Match Report

The City of Niagara Falls has received a 100% MATCH REDUCTION FOR 2009, qualifying as a severely distressed community

HOME MBE/WBE Report -HUD Form 4107 Attached

ON-SITE INSPECTIONS OF RENTAL HOUSING

The City of Niagara Falls and its sub-grantees (Center City Neighborhood Development Corp. and Niagara Falls Neighborhood Housing Services Inc) conduct inspections of HOME rental units for compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations. The following are HOME assisted rental units:

<u>Agency</u>	<u>Project Name</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Units</u>
City of NF	Vince Morello Apartments	95 th St & Frontier Avenue	80
City of NF	Unity Park	9 th Street at Depot	11
City of NF	Carolyn's House	542 6 th Street	10
Center City NDC	Mid-City Phase I	1375 & 1354 Linwood Ave	8
Center City NDC	Mid City Phase II	1536 & 1546 Willow Avenue	4
		1310 Ashland Avenue	12
		407-09 6 th Street	2
		535 Memorial Pkwy	3
		1902 Main Street	7
		501 7 th Street	7
		627 Chilton Ave	2
		1810 Willow Avenue	1
		1005 17 th Street	1
		956 Niagara Ave	3
		1813 South Ave	3
		1727 Ashland Ave	2
		1135 Ontario Avenue	5
		1528 North Avenue	3
		1107 Ontario Avenue	2
		616 Walnut Avenue	2
		829 Main Street	6
NHS		261 Portage Road	9
		501 19 th Street	3
		468-498 25 th Street	8
		637 25 th Street	2
		3031 Monroe Avenue	2

The completed units were inspected (representative randomly selected) and were found to be in compliance with local building codes. Copies of the inspection reports are maintained in the project files, listing the units inspected, dates inspected and results of the inspection.

HOMELESS

Homeless Needs

*Please also refer to the Homeless Needs Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

1. Identify actions taken to address needs of homeless persons.
2. Identify actions to help homeless persons make the transition to permanent housing and independent living.
3. Identify new Federal resources obtained from Homeless SuperNOFA.

Program Year 5 CAPER Homeless Needs response:

Homeless Assistance

The City of Niagara Falls funds a number of programs that serve homeless persons. Those programs include Family & Children's Service, Community Missions, Carolyn's House, House of Hosea, Odallam, and the YMCA. These agencies provide both emergency shelter and transitional housing for homeless persons or persons "at risk" of becoming homeless. The Niagara County Coalition for the Homeless has formulated a 10-year plan to end chronic homelessness and move families into permanent housing. The following objectives and local action steps are identified in the Continuum of Care Strategic Planning Document for Niagara County:

- Create new Public Housing beds for the chronically homeless with an aggressive follow through on existing agreements with Section 8 and the Public Housing Authorities. Priority will be given to individuals and families. It is anticipated that 5 new beds will be created in year 1 progressing to 40 new beds at the end of 10-year strategic planning period.
- Increase the percentage of homeless persons staying in public housing over 6 months to 71%. HMIS data will be utilized to effectively track cases and manage support services. Estimated percentages will increase from 60% in Year 1 to 71% in Year 10.
- Increase the percentage of homeless persons moving from transitional housing to public housing to 61% by expanding the number of available units and case management services.
- Increase the percentage of homeless persons becoming employed by 11% This effort will include the involvement of Niagara County Employment and Training in Continuum of Care development of strategies and protocols.
- Ensure that the Continuum of Care has a functional HMIS system by purchasing software and by providing training for all service providers .
-

Fellowship House Inc through its supportive Living provides vital services through its Continuum of Care which includes Community Residences, Intensive Residential Treatment for Women & Women with children, and Shelter Care Plus. Individuals move through the Continuum as they become prepared for independent and sober living. They start in community residences and move to supportive housing.

The Niagara County Continuum of Care has been restricted in their ability to receive a SuperNOFA grant award due to the lack of an approved 10-Year Plan to end Chronic homelessness. Recognizing this shortfall, the City agreed to provide \$30,000 to retain a

consultant to develop a 10-Year Plan. Working with the YWCA of Niagara Inc, a consultant has been selected and will be retained in 2010.

Specific Homeless Prevention Elements

1. Identify actions taken to prevent homelessness.

Program Year 5 CAPER Specific Housing Prevention Elements response:

Emergency Shelter Grants (ESG)

1. Identify actions to address emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless individuals and families (including significant subpopulations such as those living on the streets).
2. Assessment of Relationship of ESG Funds to Goals and Objectives
 - a. Evaluate progress made in using ESG funds to address homeless and homeless prevention needs, goals, and specific objectives established in the Consolidated Plan.
 - b. Detail how ESG projects are related to implementation of comprehensive homeless planning strategy, including the number and types of individuals and persons in households served with ESG funds.
3. Matching Resources
 - a. Provide specific sources and amounts of new funding used to meet match as required by 42 USC 11375(a)(1), including cash resources, grants, and staff salaries, as well as in-kind contributions such as the value of a building or lease, donated materials, or volunteer time.
4. State Method of Distribution
 - a. States must describe their method of distribution and how it rated and selected its local government agencies and private nonprofit organizations acting as subrecipients.
5. Activity and Beneficiary Data
 - a. Completion of attached Emergency Shelter Grant Program Performance Chart or other reports showing ESGP expenditures by type of activity. Also describe any problems in collecting, reporting, and evaluating the reliability of this information.
 - b. Homeless Discharge Coordination
 - i. As part of the government developing and implementing a homeless discharge coordination policy, ESG homeless prevention funds may be used to assist very-low income individuals and families at risk of becoming homeless after being released from publicly funded institutions such as health care facilities, foster care or other youth facilities, or corrections institutions or programs.
 - ii.
 - c. Explain how your government is instituting a homeless discharge coordination policy, and how ESG homeless prevention funds are being used in this effort.

Program Year 5 CAPER ESG response:

Assessment of Use of ESG Funds

As previously mentioned, the City of Niagara Falls funds several crisis shelter and transitional living programs for homeless persons. These programs offer on-site case management and counseling with the goal of helping participants to obtain and maintain a self-sufficient lifestyle in permanent housing.

Emergency Shelter Grant funds were used in a manner that was consistent with the goals, objectives, and priorities, established in the Consolidated Plan. The ESG Grant was allocated to 6 homeless service agencies for essential service expenses relating to their operation of emergency shelters for homeless persons. . The agencies receiving funding in 2009 are as follows:

<u>Amount</u>	<u>Agency</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Use</u>
\$25,000	Community Missions	1570-1590 Buffalo Ave	operating costs
\$25,000	Family & Children's Service	Casey/Passage House	essential services/operations
\$12,500	Fellowship House	Memorial parkway	essential services/operations
\$12,500	YMCA	215 Portage Road	operating costs
\$10,000	Odallam	915 Ferry Ave	essential services/operations
\$10,000	God's Woman House of Hosea	1866 Willow Ave	essential services/operations
\$16,214	Carolyn's House	542 6 th Street	essential services/operations

Matching Funds

The 1:1 ESG matching fund requirement has been met, pursuant to allowable forms of matching funds for each project. Matching funds were derived from paid professional staff positions (counselors, social workers, etc.) donated materials, volunteer labor calculated @\$5.00 per hour and professional services @\$10.00 per hour.

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Community Development

*Please also refer to the Community Development Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

1. Assessment of Relationship of CDBG Funds to Goals and Objectives
 - a. Assess use of CDBG funds in relation to the priorities, needs, goals, and specific objectives in the Consolidated Plan, particularly the highest priority activities.
 - b. Evaluate progress made toward meeting goals for providing affordable housing using CDBG funds, including the number and types of households served.
 - c. Indicate the extent to which CDBG funds were used for activities that benefited extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons.

Evaluation of the Use of CDBG Funds to Objectives Identified in the CPS:

The "Summary of Resources and Program Accomplishment" chart, included as an attachment to this document, outlines the priority needs established as a result of the development of the 2009 Consolidated Plan and outlines the established funding levels, dollars committed and expended, number of persons/households assisted and low/mod income benefit during the reporting period. In 2009, 85.96% of CDBG expenditures were for activities that qualified as low/mod benefit.

ASSESSMENT OF USE OF CDBG FUNDS IN RELATION TO PRIORITIES, GOALS, & OBJECTIVES IN CPS: (Please also refer to the summary accomplishment chart included in "Other Narratives", of this document.)

Housing Needs - "the provision of safe, decent affordable housing for the residents of Niagara Falls, the preservation and upgrading of existing housing stock, and the provision of affordable homeownership opportunities"

The City of Niagara Falls has designed housing programs, in conjunction with its sub-grantees that address the priority needs identified in the consolidated plan. These housing activities, including existing owner rehabilitation, investor owned rehabilitation and homeownership opportunities have been adequately funded with CDBG allocations. The preservation and upgrading of existing housing stock is the primary focus of these programs. The homeownership component provides incentives for first time homebuyers to acquire affordable homes using closing cost and down-payment assistance combined with or without a rehabilitation component, depending on the condition of the home. Investor owned properties are upgraded to meet NYS Building Code providing safe, decent and sanitary housing for low and moderate income renter households. All households assisted through these programs were at or below 80% of median income. The City projected that 89 units of housing, and 24 closing cost grants would be completed in 2009. The actual units completed in IDIS were 73 housing units and 18 closing cost grants. Additionally, we projected that 100 clients would be served at the Home Center and we actually provided services to 149 clients (homeownership counseling).

Housing programs are targeted to high need areas in the City. The summary chart below details the beneficiaries of federal housing funds by race and income group. 24% of the City's total population is minority. In 2009, 24% of the housing program beneficiaries were low income minority households. This is attributed to housing programs being targeted to areas of high poverty and minority concentration.

Sub-grantees are issued performance based contracts whereby benchmarks must be achieved in order for proposed program delivery costs and administrative fees to be earned. Benchmarks are based on housing units that receive the first construction draw during the program year.

Public Service Needs – “the provision of public services/social services to support the physical improvement of neighborhoods”

The City of Niagara Falls recognizes that in addition to improving the physical environment and living conditions for its residents, it must address other needs in the community affecting youth, senior citizens, handicapped, public safety, education and counseling and clean neighborhoods. Public service programs are funded primarily as low/mod limited clientele activities. Each agency receiving funds is required to estimate goals and objectives for funding consideration and they are required to submit performance reports at year end describing program beneficiaries and goals and objectives achieved during the program year... The City exceeded the goals and objectives set forth in the CPS for this priority need. (Also see attached performance chart)

Clearance of Blighted Structures – “the prevention or elimination of slums/blight”

All properties demolished with federal funds are vacant, blighted buildings condemned by the City’s Inspections Division. All properties are located in I/m income areas of the City designated as slum and blight areas. The City exceeded the goals and objectives set forth in the CPS for this priority need. (Also see attached performance chart)

Code Enforcement – “the preservation and upgrading of housing stock”

The Community Development Department employs two full time code enforcement officials to conduct concentrated, door-to door enforcement in targeted geographic areas of the City. In 2009 the area selected was Whitney Avenue to South Avenue from 15th Street to 18th Street. This project is designed to compliment ongoing housing and neighborhood revitalization efforts. In addition, the code officer inspects ongoing housing rehabilitation and commercial rehabilitation projects funded with CDBG & HOME funds. Compliance with violations is a n ongoing process that is monitored by the Dept of Inspections.

Economic Development Needs – “the creation of full time job opportunities for low/mod income persons

The City of Niagara Falls works in cooperation with NFC Development Corporation on economic development activities where jobs are made available to low or moderate income persons. NFC has an established loan portfolio that generates program income to pay the salaries of NFC administrators and to revolve funds for additional loans. NFC also administers the City’s MBE/WBE loan program and the Micro-Enterprise grant program. Each loan commitment designates that 1 full time job be created for every \$35,000 of CDBG funds invested. 51% of all jobs must be made available to low/mod income persons. As a result of loans provided by the City, 6 new full time jobs were created of which 5 were for I/m persons. (Also see attached performance chart)

Public Improvements/Public Facilities – “the provision of public infrastructure improvements and public facilities to support neighborhood revitalization”

The City of Niagara Falls provides public infrastructure improvements, i.e., street re-surfacing, sidewalk replacement, tree plantings, beautification projects, park improvements and public facility renovations in areas that serve and are primarily low/mod income residential neighborhoods. Infrastructure improvements are designed to compliment ongoing housing and economic development projects funded by the City. The City exceeded the goals and objectives set forth in the CPS for this priority need. (Also see attached performance chart)

2. Changes in Program Objectives

- a. Identify the nature of and the reasons for any changes in program objectives and how the jurisdiction would change its program as a result of its experiences.

Changes in Program Objectives Response:

No changes in program objectives

3. Assessment of Efforts in Carrying Out Planned Actions

- a. Indicate how grantee pursued all resources indicated in the Consolidated Plan.
- b. Indicate how grantee provided certifications of consistency in a fair and impartial manner.
- c. Indicate how grantee did not hinder Consolidated Plan implementation by action or willful inaction.

Assessment of Efforts Response:

The City of Niagara Falls pursued all resources identified in the 2009 Consolidated Plan. Owner contributions required for rehab programs administered by the City, NHS and Center City were secured during the course of the year as applications were processed. In addition, both Center City and NHS were successful in obtaining administrative grants through the NYS Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR) in the amount of \$65,000 each.

The City fairly and impartially provided certifications of consistency with the Consolidated Plan in support of applications by other entities. The City did not hinder any phase of the Consolidated Plan implementation by willful inaction.

4. For Funds Not Used for National Objectives

- a. Indicate how use of CDBG funds did not meet national objectives.
- b. Indicate how did not comply with overall benefit certification.

National Objectives Response:

CDBG Grant Funds were used exclusively for national objectives #1 and #2 listed below:

- 1) low and moderate income benefit
- 2) elimination of slums and blight
- 3) urgent need

5. Anti-displacement and Relocation – for activities that involve acquisition, rehabilitation or demolition of occupied real property
 - a. Describe steps actually taken to minimize the amount of displacement resulting from the CDBG-assisted activities.
 - b. Describe steps taken to identify households, businesses, farms or nonprofit organizations who occupied properties subject to the Uniform Relocation Act or Section 104(d) of the Housing and Community Development Act of 1974, as amended, and whether or not they were displaced, and the nature of their needs and preferences.
 - c. Describe steps taken to ensure the timely issuance of information notices to displaced households, businesses, farms, or nonprofit organizations.

Anti-Displacement/Relocation Response:

The City did not sponsor or administer any activity during the program year involving acquisition or demolition of occupied real property. All demolitions that were financed with CDBG funds occurred with vacant, blighted structures, which were condemned for demolition by the City's Department of Inspections. All property acquired with CDBG funds for affordable homeownership programs were vacant at the time of initial purchase offer and at acquisition.

The rehabilitation programs administered in the City that involve rehabilitation of occupied real property have no impact on displacement of households. Rehabilitation programs are largely offered to existing owner occupied household thereby negating any potential displacement. The rental rehabilitation programs that are offered for the most part occur with vacant residential units. However, if the units do happen to be occupied owners are informed and instructed at intake that the project is subject to the Uniform Relocation Act (URA) and Section 104(d) of the Community Development Act.

6. Low/Mod Job Activities – for economic development activities undertaken where jobs were made available but not taken by low- or moderate-income persons
 - a. Describe actions taken by grantee and businesses to ensure first consideration was or will be given to low/mod persons.
 - b. List by job title of all the permanent jobs created/retained and those that were made available to low/mod persons.
 - c. If any of jobs claimed as being available to low/mod persons require special skill, work experience, or education, provide a description of steps being taken or that will be taken to provide such skills, experience, or education.

Low/Mod Jobs Response:

Economic Development activities undertaken during the program year were designed to create jobs that would be made available to low and moderate-income persons. At least 51% of all jobs created are required to be made available and first consideration given to low/mod income persons. The job creation chart attached to the CAPERS report identifies the projected jobs to be created as a result of each economic development activity, the required jobs to be made available to low/mod income persons and the results to date during the program year. 6.5 full time jobs and were created as a result to CDBG funded economic development activities in 2009. Of the total, 5.5 jobs were filled by low and moderate income persons.

The City monitors this aspect of the Economic Development program closely and interviews employers and employees to verify the numbers reported by the loan recipient

7. Low/Mod Limited Clientele Activities – for activities not falling within one of the categories of presumed limited clientele low and moderate income benefit
 - a. Describe how the nature, location, or other information demonstrates the activities benefit a limited clientele at least 51% of whom are low- and moderate-income.

Low/Mod Limited Clientele Response:

The following activities were classified as low/mod limited clientele in 2009. All of the activities in this category principally benefit low and moderate income persons. This was determined based on the nature and location of the programs being offered. Program services for the Police Substations, "New Jerusalem Boy's Reporting Center, Youth Motivation Movement are designed to address needs and services of the Highland Avenue area of the City. The Highland Avenue Area, Census Tract 202 has the largest concentration of minorities in the City and the lowest per capita income of any neighborhood and highest poverty rate in the City. According to 200 Census data 82.7% of all households are low and moderate income.

The Fire Education Coordinator is limited to providing services in low and moderate income areas of the City and to special groups such as block clubs senior citizens that comprise or represent a high percentage of low and moderate income households.

The 18th Street Resource Center is located in the mid-city area of the City. The nature and location of the programs being offered together with data supplied by the organizations indicate that the youth population served resides in the central part of the City approximating Census Tracts 205, 209, 212 and 213. Each of these census tracts has more than 51% of the households at or below low and moderate income thresholds.

8. Program income received
 - a. Detail the amount of program income reported that was returned to each individual revolving fund, e.g., housing rehabilitation, economic development, or other type of revolving fund.
 - b. Detail the amount repaid on each float-funded activity.
 - c. Detail all other loan repayments broken down by the categories of housing rehabilitation, economic development, or other.
 - d. Detail the amount of income received from the sale of property by parcel.

Program Income Response:

(SEE ATTCHMENT IN OTHER NARRATIVES SECTION)

- 9.
10. Prior period adjustments – where reimbursement was made this reporting period for expenditures (made in previous reporting periods) that have been disallowed, provide the following information:
 - a. The activity name and number as shown in IDIS;
 - b. The program year(s) in which the expenditure(s) for the disallowed activity(ies) was reported;
 - c. The amount returned to line-of-credit or program account; and
 - d. Total amount to be reimbursed and the time period over which the reimbursement is to be made, if the reimbursement is made with multi-year payments.

Prior Period Adjustments Response:

No prior-period adjustments were made

11. Loans and other receivables

- a. List the principal balance for each float-funded activity outstanding as of the end of the reporting period and the date(s) by which the funds are expected to be received.
- b. List the total number of other loans outstanding and the principal balance owed as of the end of the reporting period.
- c. List separately the total number of outstanding loans that are deferred or forgivable, the principal balance owed as of the end of the reporting period, and the terms of the deferral or forgiveness.
- d. Detail the total number and amount of loans made with CDBG funds that have gone into default and for which the balance was forgiven or written off during the reporting period.
- e. Provide a List of the parcels of property owned by the grantee or its subrecipients that have been acquired or improved using CDBG funds and that are available for sale as of the end of the reporting period.

Loans and Other Receivables Response:

(SEE ATTACHMENT IN OTHER NARRATIVES SECTION)

12. Lump sum agreements

- a. Provide the name of the financial institution.
- b. Provide the date the funds were deposited.
- c. Provide the date the use of funds commenced.
- d. Provide the percentage of funds disbursed within 180 days of deposit in the institution.

Lump sum Agreement Response:

The City does not have any lump sum agreements

13. Housing Rehabilitation – for each type of rehabilitation program for which projects/units were reported as completed during the program year

- a. Identify the type of program and number of projects/units completed for each program.
- b. Provide the total CDBG funds involved in the program.
- c. Detail other public and private funds involved in the project.

Housing Rehabilitation Response:

(SEE SUMMARY CHART, PAGE 2 AND COMPLETION CHART PAGE 26)

14. Neighborhood Revitalization Strategies – for grantees that have HUD-approved neighborhood revitalization strategies

- a. Describe progress against benchmarks for the program year. For grantees with Federally-designated EZs or ECs that received HUD approval for a neighborhood revitalization strategy, reports that are required as part of the EZ/EC process shall suffice for purposes of reporting progress.

Neighborhood Revitalization Strategy Response:

The City does not utilize a HUD approved Neighborhood Revitalization Strategy

Program Year 5 CAPER Community Development response:

Antipoverty Strategy

1. Describe actions taken during the last year to reduce the number of persons living below the poverty level.

Program Year 5 CAPER Antipoverty Strategy response:

The City of Niagara Falls Section 8 Leased Housing Program continued to administer the Family Self-Sufficiency Program. Under the FSS Program, participants are able to establish an escrow account with HUD funds when they have an increase in income from employment. The Section 8 Office deposits these funds in an interest bearing savings account for the participants. The FSS program networks with supportive services that enable participants to improve and maintain employment. Participants that have successfully completed the program have received money from their escrow account in excess of \$6,000. Current FSS participants have accounts ranging from \$75.00 to over \$10,000. Upon achieving the goals set forth and graduation from the FSS program, the participant may access the account money.

The City also allocates CDBG funding to support public service activities that seek to reduce poverty through training and employment programs.

NON-HOMELESS SPECIAL NEEDS

Non-homeless Special Needs

*Please also refer to the Non-homeless Special Needs Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

1. Identify actions taken to address special needs of persons that are not homeless but require supportive housing, (including persons with HIV/AIDS and their families).

Program Year 5 CAPER Non-homeless Special Needs response:

Family & Children's Service of Niagara Inc. provides supportive housing for chronically mentally ill persons, victims of domestic violence and low income parents, the latter through their Healthy Families Program. These special needs non-homeless persons/families receive case management services, outreach and financial assistance in order to maintain live in the community in a safe environment. Fellowship House serves person with addictions through its Supportive Living Program providing a safe apartment environment while also providing case management and group counseling. The goal is independent living, including support for education, job training and employment

Specific HOPWA Objectives

*Please also refer to the HOPWA Table in the Needs.xls workbook.

1. Overall Assessment of Relationship of HOPWA Funds to Goals and Objectives
Grantees should demonstrate through the CAPER and related IDIS reports the progress they are making at accomplishing identified goals and objectives with HOPWA funding. Grantees should demonstrate:
 - a. That progress is being made toward meeting the HOPWA goal for providing affordable housing using HOPWA funds and other resources for persons with HIV/AIDS and their families through a comprehensive community plan;
 - b. That community-wide HIV/AIDS housing strategies are meeting HUD's national goal of increasing the availability of decent, safe, and affordable housing for low-income persons living with HIV/AIDS;
 - c. That community partnerships between State and local governments and community-based non-profits are creating models and innovative strategies to serve the housing and related supportive service needs of persons living with HIV/AIDS and their families;
 - d. That through community-wide strategies Federal, State, local, and other resources are matched with HOPWA funding to create comprehensive housing strategies;
 - e. That community strategies produce and support actual units of housing for persons living with HIV/AIDS; and finally,
 - f. That community strategies identify and supply related supportive services in conjunction with housing to ensure the needs of persons living with HIV/AIDS and their families are met.
2. This should be accomplished by providing an executive summary (1-5 pages) that includes:
 - a. Grantee Narrative
 - i. Grantee and Community Overview
 - (1) A brief description of your organization, the area of service, the name of each project sponsor and a broad overview of the range/type of housing activities and related services

- (2) How grant management oversight of project sponsor activities is conducted and how project sponsors are selected
 - (3) A description of the local jurisdiction, its need, and the estimated number of persons living with HIV/AIDS
 - (4) A brief description of the planning and public consultations involved in the use of HOPWA funds including reference to any appropriate planning document or advisory body
 - (5) What other resources were used in conjunction with HOPWA funded activities, including cash resources and in-kind contributions, such as the value of services or materials provided by volunteers or by other individuals or organizations
 - (6) Collaborative efforts with related programs including coordination and planning with clients, advocates, Ryan White CARE Act planning bodies, AIDS Drug Assistance Programs, homeless assistance programs, or other efforts that assist persons living with HIV/AIDS and their families.
- ii. Project Accomplishment Overview
 - (1) A brief summary of all housing activities broken down by three types: emergency or short-term rent, mortgage or utility payments to prevent homelessness; rental assistance; facility based housing, including development cost, operating cost for those facilities and community residences
 - (2) The number of units of housing which have been created through acquisition, rehabilitation, or new construction since 1993 with any HOPWA funds
 - (3) A brief description of any unique supportive service or other service delivery models or efforts
 - (4) Any other accomplishments recognized in your community due to the use of HOPWA funds, including any projects in developmental stages that are not operational.
 - iii. Barriers or Trends Overview
 - (1) Describe any barriers encountered, actions in response to barriers, and recommendations for program improvement
 - (2) Trends you expect your community to face in meeting the needs of persons with HIV/AIDS, and
 - (3) Any other information you feel may be important as you look at providing services to persons with HIV/AIDS in the next 5-10 years
- b. Accomplishment Data
 - i. Completion of CAPER Performance Chart 1 of Actual Performance in the provision of housing (Table II-1 to be submitted with CAPER).
 - ii. Completion of CAPER Performance Chart 2 of Comparison to Planned Housing Actions (Table II-2 to be submitted with CAPER).

Program Year 5 CAPER Specific HOPWA Objectives response:

This section is not applicable. City of Niagara Falls does not participate in the HOPWA Program

OTHER NARRATIVE

Include any CAPER information that was not covered by narratives in any other section.
Program Year 5 CAPER Other Narrative response: